black, asian and minority ethnic leadership in the creative and cultural sector
I live and work in London, one of the most diverse cities in the world. Thirty per cent of Londoners are from black and minority ethnic backgrounds, thousands more, like me, are of mixed heritage and the numbers are increasing every year. People are attracted to the capital precisely because it is so cosmopolitan. Such extraordinary diversity is what makes our arts and culture so vibrant and exciting, not just in London, but across the UK.

However, as this timely report confirms, our rich diversity is not sufficiently reflected in the leadership of the creative and cultural sector. But surely, if there is no diversity at the top of an organisation, it is unlikely that there will be much at its heart. The compelling creative case for diversity is equally matched by the business case. If our great cultural organisations fail to reflect the UK’s changing demographics and embrace diversity in its broadest sense, at best they will become irrelevant and at worst they risk going out of business.

I have long championed the importance of diversity in the arts and broadcasting and am proud of the progress we have made at Arts Council England over the last 8 years. The Arts Council’s decibel initiative has made a significant difference by raising the profile of culturally diverse arts and artists and strengthening the infrastructure through strategic alliances and promotions. The partnership between decibel and the Cultural Leadership Programme to commission this important research into Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic leadership is another step forward. We now have strong, independent evidence with which to argue our case for more equal representation at the top.

I hope that cultural agencies, arts organisations, artists, and all of us who care passionately about culture, will take this excellent report to heart and work together to create strong leadership that reflects the diversity and the reality of the world we live in today.

Lady Sue Woodford Hollick
Chair, Arts Council England, London
The Cultural Leadership Programme has put diversity at the heart of what it does and, as Chair of the Programme, I am certain that increasing the diversity of our cultural and creative leaders is critical to the creative and business success of the sector.

That Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic (BAME) leaders are under-represented in the sector is widely acknowledged but if we are to measure progress we need to know exactly where we stand. The Cultural Leadership Programme commissioned this report with our partner, Arts Council England decibel, in order to consider the evidence of leaders from BAME backgrounds and provide a benchmark for measuring the progress the sector has made in diversifying its leadership.

The report demonstrates that there is still some way to go before we achieve a leadership spread that represents the diversity of our population. Whilst 11.9% of people of working age in England are from BAME backgrounds only 2.3% of accredited library professionals, 4.4% of middle managers in national and hub museums and 5.5% of those running independent creative and cultural businesses are BAME.

However, there is some positive progress particularly in public bodies such as Arts Council England, the Museum Libraries and Archives Council and in the 10.8% of Department of Culture Media and Sport board appointments to 600 cultural organisations that are from BAME backgrounds. There are also examples of good practice emerging in the private sector in publishing and advertising.

Diversity is actively promoted at the Cultural Leadership Programme and the high BAME response to our activities demonstrates that there is real interest from BAME communities in working in the creative and cultural sector. It is imperative that the enthusiasm of these individuals and the proactive strategies of the organisations are soon reflected in the broader diversity of leaders that so many of us champion.

This report makes a number of recommendations which we will share with the sector and act on to develop the diversity of its leaders. The Cultural Leadership Programme will continue to prioritise diversity and diverse routes to leadership to ensure that those from all backgrounds are supported in their leadership development.

David Kershaw
Chair, Cultural Leadership Programme
## contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Context</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The current position of Black, Asian and minority ethnic leaders</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- England’s Black, Asian and minority ethnic workforce</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Workforce profile of the creative and cultural industries</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Government department and agencies</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Arts sector</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Museums, libraries and archives</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Creative industries and private sector</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Conclusions</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The case for Black, Asian and minority ethnic leadership</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Recognising the problem</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic views on leadership diversity</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The response of the creative and cultural sector</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Diversity policies</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Workforce development policies and programmes</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Research, consultation and evaluation</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Specific initiatives</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Advocacy and support groups</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Creative industries and private sector response</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Challenges for Black, Asian and minority ethnic leaders</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Leadership in large statutory organisations</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Leadership in small to medium enterprises and self-employment</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Wider issues for the sector</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Training and professional development opportunities and issues</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Professional development programmes</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Positive action training</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Respondents’ views on leadership development programmes</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Formal education provision</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Informal education and training</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Conclusions and recommendations</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td>methodology</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Benchmarking</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Research method</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>87</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The failure to recruit and develop a more diverse workforce has been highlighted by the Department for Culture Media and Sport as a potential problem for the future growth and prosperity of the creative and cultural sector. The under-representation of Black, Asian and minority ethnic leaders in the sector is a pressing issue that is evidenced by all the currently available data.

Some people have assumed that the lack of representation of people from Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) backgrounds within the sector is due to a lack of interest by ethnic minorities in careers in the creative and cultural industries. However, there is evidence of a high level of interest from BAME communities in working in the arts and cultural sector, and recruitment at lower levels in these organisations often reflects more closely the local working age BAME populations. The question is why are these individuals in entry-level jobs (administration and frontline) not progressing to higher levels.

In order to understand and address the reasons for under-representation in the sector and the limited progression into leadership roles we need to have a more information on the challenges faced by potential leaders from BAME backgrounds and sufficient data to set a baseline against which future progress can be measured.

To help address these issues, the Cultural Leadership Programme and Arts Council England’s decibel initiative commissioned The Change Institute to undertake the first comprehensive baseline report on BAME leadership in the creative and cultural sector. It has been done with cross sector support from Arts Council England, the Museums, Libraries and Archives Council (MLA) and Creative & Cultural Skills (CCSkills).
the challenge

11.9% of England’s working age population is of Black, Asian and minority ethnic background. However, available data on leadership diversity indicates that progress in the creative and cultural sector is lagging behind in a number of areas:

• 2.3% of accredited library professionals are BAME

• 3.7% of senior civil servants at the Department for Culture Media and Sport (DCMS) are BAME

• 3% of directors of publishing companies are BAME

• 3.3% of strategic and operations managers in national and hub museums are BAME

• 3.3% of sole directors in the creative and cultural sector are BAME

• 4% of editorial department staff in publishing companies are BAME

• 4.4% of middle managers in national and hub museums are BAME

• 4.6% of the entire archive workforce regardless of seniority are BAME

• 5.5% running their business in the creative and cultural sector are BAME
The DCMS’s drive to broaden the diversity of boards, MLA’s Renaissance in the Regions workforce development programme and the implementation of Arts Council England’s strategy to diversify its own workforce and that of its Regularly Funded Organisations (RFOs) is having an impact:

- 6.3% of over 850 RFOs are BAME led
- 10.2% of managers in RFOs are BAME
- 15% of board members in RFOs are BAME
- 10.8% of DCMS board appointments to 600 organisations are BAME
- 10.5% of MLA staff are BAME
- 12.8% of senior managers at Arts Council England are BAME
Establishing a baseline

There are still large gaps in data availability, particularly in relation to the private sector, and this makes a holistic and detailed understanding of the scale and extent of BAME under-representation in the creative and cultural sector difficult. In addition, establishing a clear baseline of BAME leadership is complicated by the lack of a clear definition of what constitutes leadership in the sector. In order to ensure that the number and progress of BAME creative and cultural business leaders and owners is tracked to a useful degree there need to be significant changes in the collection and reporting of creative and cultural industry data.

There is, however, a steady improvement in the collection and availability of workforce data by Non Departmental Public Bodies (NDPBs) and other public sector organisations, which now makes it possible to base strategies on a stronger evidence base. However, private sector data remains patchy and variable. Existing industry monitoring mechanisms, including the DCMS Evidence Tool Kit, do not incorporate ethnicity monitoring and there are no current structures for collation of ethnicity-related data across the sector. DCMS’s strategic documents for the development of the sector, Staying Ahead and Creative Britain, highlight diversity as a key issue and commitment. However, the lack of guidance on implementing diversity strategies or on monitoring the equality impact of current strategies remains an issue.

Addressing the challenge

Some parts of the sector have been quicker to address the challenge. Arts Council England has been undertaking developmental work over a number of years that has produced quantifiable results. MLA has prioritised the issue in the last few years and has recently undertaken a comprehensive diversity mapping exercise of national and hub museums to establish the workforce profile. Its pioneering work with the Museums Association to deliver the Diversify programme has demonstrated good results. The libraries and archives sector is now following the lead of museums and beginning to focus on diversity monitoring and development initiatives.

The progress made by the Arts Council on the basis of clear targets and strategies for employment and funding allocation through its Race Equality Scheme (RES) indicates the effectiveness of persistence and consistency in establishing strategic direction and investment in ensuring desirable outcomes and progress. Establishing targets provides organisations with a goal to work towards, as well as a focus for planning and action. However, targets need to be carefully calibrated and related to the specifics of the BAME labour market and dynamics for the sector, sub-sector and job roles. The use of crude national BAME population figures means that initiatives might be seen as successful in meeting recruitment targets that appear high, when the reality is that they are actually set far too low. Conversely, organisations can be unsuccessful in reaching what is in reality an overambitious target.
Individual programmes and initiatives are to be welcomed. A number of them have been well conceived and produced quantifiable results. However, across the sector there is a high degree of fragmentation and piecemeal work in the pursuit of workforce diversity. Many programmes and initiatives inevitably draw on an institutional and organisational view of recruitment and workforce profile needs rather than on an industry-wide view of leadership or the development needs of potential BAME recruits and staff across the sector. This is likely to present a significant problem in the medium term where the sector has been successful in attracting new entrants at both junior and senior levels but fails to retain them and provide appropriate progression paths. In other parts of the public sector there is widespread evidence that where organisations have vigorously pursued equality and diversity policies for many years there continue to be problems in ensuring that BAME staff come through the system and are successful in being promoted into leadership positions. Where organisations have recruited directly into leadership positions there are indications that BAME leaders may be less successful than their white counterparts. Often organisations seek out a more diverse pool of candidates and may be successful in recruitment but fail to recognise that the organisation – having sought out the ‘different’ – needs to change and support the person more effectively if they are to be successful in the organisation. Retention is likely to become a major problem if there is not continued significant cultural change in many of the key organisations in the sector.

As well as clear recruitment targets, consideration of the quality of experiences of BAME leaders is critical in determining whether or not they choose to remain within mainstream creative and cultural organisations. Low employment mobility, the perception of the persistence of old boys’ networks and of a low ethnicity ceiling can lead many potential BAME leaders to feel suffocated through a lack of opportunity and to lose morale, motivation and aspiration. Addressing these issues requires organisations to simultaneously focus on institutional cultures and wider change.

The key success criteria in developing workforce diversity relates to there being no artificial social structures and organisational barriers to the achievement of BAME people. This does not imply that there should be an even distribution of BAME people across the creative and cultural sector. Rather, it is for the industry and its sub-sectors to demonstrate that there are no such barriers and discrimination based on ethnicity. People of BAME background who choose to do so should be as able to access and develop their careers and lead in the sector as their white counterparts. This implies that benchmarking approaches need to incorporate qualitative research concerning the perceptions, changes in perceptions, and career choices of BAME recruits alongside quantitative measures to assess progress. In addition to recruitment, monitoring organisations should also measure their progress through staff surveys and through regular equality auditing of performance appraisal systems.
recommendations

Take strategic action

- Repeat the BAME leadership study. This will enable the identification of additional data and the inclusion of any further work done in the interim. Parts of the sector have already made a great deal of progress in the collection of ethnic monitoring and baseline data. The focus now should be on keeping up this momentum and investment, as well as on facilitating the sharing of strategies and best practice with those who are lagging behind.

- The sector needs to consider a long-term structure for the collection, collation and sharing of data and best practices on BAME leadership. Initiatives in the private sector such as the IPA census of the advertising industry and the Diversity in Publishing Network survey of the publishing and literature industry can be leveraged and become part of a regular and consistent sector-wide benchmark. The Cultural Leadership Programme could take the lead in this initially, benchmarking progress against this report. This could lead to the development of a co-ordination mechanism involving all the key stakeholders in the sector and a body of work that the sector can take forward into the longer term, potentially under the remit of CCSkills.

Develop the creative and cultural leadership programmes

- More proactive seeking out of talented BAME people will further enhance the effectiveness of creative and cultural leadership programmes. This can be done through the development and use of a database of potential talent and available placements that can be readily accessed by programme providers. The Cultural Leadership Programme is in a position to build on existing contacts and to strengthen and expand those both regionally and across the creative and cultural sector.

- A priority should be to ensure that BAME individuals are aware of and able to access publicly funded creative and cultural leadership and development programmes. Course providers should consider the use of regional ambassadors to inform potential BAME leaders about opportunities for leadership development and dissolve any perception that these are London-centric.

- Providers should seek to enhance the diversity aspects of course provision through an additional range of catalytic discussion, exploration and support opportunities, ranging from lunch-time seminars and workshops to opportunities for small group discussions with acknowledged BAME leaders in the sector. These could be supplemented by a package of mentoring and coaching support for individuals after they have taken part in the programmes. The proposed Powerbrokers Advance programmes appear to be a positive response to this need.
• There is also scope for more innovative and effective partnering with creative and cultural organisations. Opportunities for engaging with these organisations, such as placements, are immensely valuable in creating more exposure both for BAME leaders and the organisations themselves and give potential leaders more opportunities for development.

**Widen the diversity of the pool of students and future BAME leaders**

• Education and training providers do collect relevant ethnicity data. However, they need to widen the diversity of the pool of students and future BAME leaders by putting in place active programmes and initiatives to increase awareness, knowledge and interest among BAME secondary school children and Further Education students in careers in the sector. Providers should work collaboratively to support the development of a creative and cultural industries infrastructure for school-age children that includes informed career guidance and signposting of routes by individuals who have credibility and legitimacy with these students.

• A key priority is to begin to identify career destinations for BAME students in order to ascertain where the problems and blockages may be in translating education and qualifications into employment in the sector.

**Public agencies and the sector must continue to take the lead**

• Organisations should consider wider culture change approaches alongside ethnic monitoring and recruitment strategies. An important area for development is the provision of training for managers in intercultural competencies and in the recognition of transferable skills so that BAME staff skills and competencies are recognised and they are nurtured and encouraged to progress in their organisations and the sector.

• Broader board-level BAME representation is improving. However, it should be widened in order to address the syndrome of the same circle of well-known BAME trustees being asked on to the boards of a wide range of organisations. While there are small-scale initiatives such as GAIN working on this issue, at a national level DCMS and Arts Council England should establish a national BAME board bank and develop a new generation of potential BAME trustees.

• The creative and cultural sector should promote its work much more widely in BAME communities and disseminate more basic information as well as creating mechanisms for the development of new networking opportunities. Consultancy and advisory support is often critical for new BAME enterprises and organisations, while for those that are already established similar support is often required to develop growth strategies.
• The sector should learn from the other parts of the public sector, particularly in relation to developing sustainable strategies for the development of BAME leaders. It should also look to parts of the private sector that have used diversity effectively in the search for innovation and growth in markets and market share.

DCMS has a continuing role to play

• DCMS’s Non Departmental Public Bodies (NDPBs) are at the front line of delivery. However, the DCMS itself can provide a valuable leadership role in co-coordinating the activity of all stakeholders and sharing good practice in data collection to address BAME under-representation across the sector. A key priority is to enhance private sector ethnic monitoring and data collection through its activities under the Creative Economy or similar programmes.

• DCMS should consider developing an action plan and structure to deliver the commitment to diversity set out in its Creative Britain strategy. This could include putting in place appropriate monitoring and evaluation arrangements to ensure that progress on diversity is measured throughout the implementation of the strategy. Its support for implementation could include the development of guidance for the sector on appropriate data collection in relation to BAME representation, including on the workforce, business ownership and numbers in governance structures.

• DCMS could set up a series of workshops to engage NDPBs and private sector organisations and share best practice in management, marketing and leadership practice across the creative and cultural industries. This would build on the Workforce Diversity Working Group that already exists to share good practice and includes DCMS, MLA, Arts Council England, CCSkills, national museums, hub museums, the Museums Association and the GLA.

Lakhbir Bhandal
Laurence Hopkins
Jagtar Singh
The Change Institute
This report aims to establish an evidence base and advance the understanding of culturally diverse leadership by identifying the current baseline for Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) leadership in the creative and cultural sector. There is a widespread acknowledgement of under-representation and a clear need to map its extent and scale by identifying where the BAME leaders and decision-makers are in the sector as well as their profiles and roles.

The analysis is placed within the broader context for diversity and highlights the approaches currently being promoted within the sector to address issues of BAME under-representation. The study offers a baseline that will enable comparative assessments to be made on an empirical basis in future years of the progress made in promoting culturally diverse leadership in the sector.

The report is structured as follows: a brief introduction to the research context is followed by a mapping of the current position of BAME leaders in the sector on the basis of available data. The study goes on to consider the case for BAME leadership and the varying responses of the sector, including some good practice and initiatives. The challenges that BAME leaders face in the workplace is followed by a consideration of the training and professional development opportunities and the diversity issues that emerge. Finally, we conclude and make recommendations for the commissioners of this report, other key bodies and the sector as a whole.
The creative and cultural sector is a strategic area of growing importance for the UK economy and plays a key role in supporting, communicating and transforming society’s cultural values. The UK has the largest creative sector in the European Union\(^1\) and it is also the second largest sector in London after financial and business services. The creative and cultural sector contributes £23.5 billion to the economy and Creative & Cultural Skills estimates that there are currently some 542,000\(^2\) people working directly in creative and cultural industries across 62,000 organisations in the UK.\(^3\)

Britain’s creative economy requires strong and confident leaders equipped with the necessary tools to ensure that the UK retains its place as one of the foremost creative hubs of the world. While the demand for leadership skills in the industries is high, the majority of creative and cultural organisations are small and there is a high degree of freelancing in many of the industries. 40% of those working in the cultural and creative industries are self-employed; 94% of businesses have less than nine staff. Because of the small size of the vast majority of organisations and the number of creative freelancers, Creative & Cultural Skills predict that between 2004 and 2014 two thirds of the growth in the workforce will be in senior, managerial, professional and associate professional roles.\(^4\)

The predicted growth in the creative economy in an increasingly competitive global market means it is widely accepted that there needs to be investment in both current and future leaders.

What is leadership and who are the leaders in the sector?

It is widely recognised that many people in the creative and cultural sector do not work as part of hierarchical structures within organisations. This makes conventional concepts of leadership, linked to span of authority and control in organisations, difficult to work with in the sector.

---

2. There are various definitions of the sector and methods that are used to estimate its size. This report uses the definitions and economic analysis by Creative & Cultural Skills.
3. Creative & Cultural Skills (2007), *Footprint: A baseline for the creative and cultural sector*
4. Creative & Cultural Skills (2008), *Creative Blueprint*
A parallel piece of work commissioned by the Cultural Leadership Programme on women in leadership in the sector used the following working definitions of leaders:

For those working within organisational structures:
**Senior leaders:** those in positions of chief executive, managing director, chair or organisational lead.
*Mid-career leaders:* those in positions of senior specialist, senior or board director, trustees, governor, general or senior manager.
**Emerging leaders:** those at junior levels but aspiring to the above two categories.

For independents - those not within organisational structures:
**Senior leaders:** those who have a national or international impact.
*Mid-career leaders:* those who have sub-regional, city region or regional impact.
**Emerging leaders:** those who aspire to sub-regional, city region or regional impact or national or international impact.

However, because the extent of an individual’s geographical remit does not necessarily relate to their being a leader, a further way to identify leaders is by the activities they undertake. Respondents to this study were defined as leading the development of the sector if they indicated that they contributed the following:
- setting the vision
- building the profile of the sector
- artistic/technical innovation
- developing strategy and policy
- developing partnerships and stakeholder relationships

These people were categorised as an existing leader, regardless of their geographic remit and impact.

The late Peter Drucker asserted in 1996 that the only definition of a leader is ‘someone who has followers’. Despite this, numerous and competing definitions of leaders and leadership continue to proliferate. Throughout leadership literature and indeed throughout the views of respondents in this study, it is clear that leadership can be found in a wide variety of forms and in numerous places. Leadership is not absolute and being defined as a leader depends on context. An individual may be a leader in a specific group or community setting but not in an organisation and vice versa.

Within the creative and cultural sector there is also an emerging debate around the role of cultural leadership and cultural leaders. Leadership in the cultural sector is often seen as distinct from leadership in creative businesses due to the nature of ‘cultural value’, ‘institutional value’ and the relationship that organisations have with their stakeholders. The Clore Duffield Foundation Task Force report, An Investment in the Rising Generation of Cultural Leaders is Necessary, and Timely, states that: “In the arts, there is no simple ‘bottom line’, but a diversity of interests and constituencies to serve. Businesses may have multiple stakeholders, but they are not expected to meet the requirements of social policies imposed by funders, as appears to be increasingly the case in the arts. Conditions of law

---

5 Peter Drucker (1996), *Leader of the Future*
6 Leadership is generally thought to be in some way distinct from management. However, the terms are often used interchangeably. Management has been described by some as an exercise of power through the virtue of position, and leadership as exercising power through influence. This distinction is not clear cut and there are many areas of overlap. Managers can be leaders and it is useful for people seen as leaders to possess good management skills.
7 Hewison R. (2006), *Leadership and cultural values*, Demos
8 The Task Force was set up in response to crises in some of Britain’s key institutions that were related to the need to expand the pool of individuals with the skills and experience to manage and lead the UK’s top cultural institutions.
and governance are different from those in business. Cultural sector leaders are required to manage with scarce resources, and make strategic plans in the absence of long-term financial security. They are likely to use unpaid volunteers, either as board members or as key personnel. They are under steady pressure to complete short-term projects while at the same time ensuring constant innovation.”

While the Task Force report focused primarily on those leading the UK’s leading cultural institutions, according to stakeholders and practitioners in the field, leaders are not just to be found at the top of institutions and organisations. Leadership is perceived to be present at all levels as well as outside of institutions. While traditional concepts about where leaders are located - namely holding a position of formal authority in an organisation - remain, these were accompanied by a wide variety of perceptions about who the leaders are in the sector, where they are located, and about what specifically constitutes leadership.

Some respondents to our study asserted that those with the most followers and influence can often be sole enterprise owners with large personal networks and a wealth of experience in the sector. Others emphasised that individuals may be identified as leaders by the work they do outside of their primary job roles, for example in community based projects. Focus group respondents also suggested that leadership could entail:

- Project level leadership on issue-based projects
- Getting positioned as a leader through public speaking and being seen as an advocate
- Being your own boss: setting up and managing one’s own company
- Being on external networks, committees and boards
- Acting autonomously and choosing a specific career trajectory and direction

In an effort to quantify leadership this study adopts a broad definition of leadership that encompasses numbers in senior management and governance positions as well as those in various forms of self-employment. While not all those covered by the statistics would be necessarily identified as leaders, according to some definitions the statistics act as a proxy for representation in positions that are likely to have access to resources, decision-making, and input into the direction of an organisation or company. In this study, individuals running their own companies and freelance artists define themselves as leaders and have been included within our parameters of leadership. The study therefore also looks at the numbers of those directing their own companies and working as freelancers in the industry. We have placed these numbers in the context of England’s BAME working age population and the profile of the industry.
This section sets out the current position of Black, Asian and minority ethnic staff in leadership and management positions in the creative and cultural industries. It begins with an overview of data availability in relation to ethnicity and goes on to provide data on the demographics of England’s working age population and on key government agencies involved in the creative and cultural industries, as well as industry-specific data.

Creative and cultural industry leaders and policy makers need to understand what the increasing ethnic diversity of the UK population and the proportion of those of minority ethnic background in the working age population means for the sector. It is important that monitoring mechanisms are in place to track progress to ensure that creative and cultural organisations are representative of the communities they serve and can access the widest possible pool of talent. Ethnic monitoring can highlight possible inequalities, pinpoint areas for investigation, and facilitate removal of unfair barriers to recruitment and career progression. The Equality and Human Rights Commission notes that: “Without ethnic monitoring, an organisation will never know whether its race equality scheme or policy is working. There is a risk that people will just see the policy as paying lip service to race equality. If this happens, the policy could lose credibility and commitment among the staff who have to deliver it, as well as the people who are affected by it. To have an equality policy without ethnic monitoring is like aiming for good financial management without keeping financial records.”

10 EHRC (2008), Ethnic Monitoring
Ethnic monitoring is a vital first step in the assessment of the levels of inequalities and for providing an evidence base against which to measure progress. It is the fundamental building block of a successful diversity programme.\textsuperscript{11}

There has been a great deal of interest in mapping the economic impact of the creative and cultural industries, currently undertaken by the government through the Department for Culture, Media and Sport (DCMS) Creative Economy Programme.\textsuperscript{12} However, data collection and dissemination in the creative and cultural sector on ethnicity in employment has been, and continues to be, inconsistent. While there is a general duty for public bodies to collect data on the ethnicity of their staff by grade and full/part time status and publish this annually, compliance is patchy and inconsistent. The private sector has no similar legal obligation and it is usually only larger private sector companies that have monitored and made these figures available to date. Until now there has not been any concerted effort to collate the data available from a wide variety of different sources to provide an overview of leadership in the sector as a whole.

Official industry statistics are of limited value. Business databases often fail to track the ethnicity of business ownership and those that do often do not provide enough detail on the nature of business activity to identify the specific situation in the creative sector.\textsuperscript{13} Definitions of the creative and cultural industries are currently being updated as the current set of standard industry classifications (SIC) and standard occupational classifications (SOC) have not kept pace with changes in the sector and its place within the UK economy. This should aid future data collection and analysis.\textsuperscript{14}

More positively, data collection and monitoring is improving in both the public and private sectors. In the public sector, agencies responsible for the arts and museums, libraries and archives are not only monitoring their own workforce and using statistics to enhance their recruitment strategies and human resource functions but are also monitoring the organisations that they fund. Arts Council England now monitors the workforce diversity of its 880 Regularly Funded Organisations in England by grade and by employment status. This provides an excellent data source for tracking progress on race equality in the arts. The Museums, Libraries and Archives Council (MLA) undertook a workforce mapping exercise in 2007/08 that has provided details on all national and hub museums. The analysis provides detailed information on the museums workforce by ethnicity, grade and employment status and provides a comprehensive benchmark for the sector.

Some professional membership bodies in the sector also monitor the ethnicity of their membership base. Some bodies we spoke to who are not currently monitoring had plans to do so for their next membership renewal. This is particularly useful for museums, libraries and archives where professional accreditations are important for career progression and entry into management and leadership positions.

In the private sector, where ethnic monitoring is less well established, a small number of larger organisations are monitoring workforce diversity as part of their broader diversity and workforce

\textsuperscript{11} Race for Opportunity (2003), Monitoring Ethnicity
\textsuperscript{12} Creative Economy Programme website: www.cep.culture.gov.uk
\textsuperscript{13} For example the Annual Business Inquiry, the Inter Departmental Business Register, and the UK Innovation Survey do not monitor businesses by the ethnicity of their ownership. The Annual Small Business Survey does provide some information on the ethnicity of business owners but only supplies broad data that cannot be disaggregated to identify the range of activity and occupations in particular sectors.
development policies. For example, Pearson, which owns the publishing house Penguin, monitors the ethnicity of their workforce, as does the music-publishing organisation EMI. From our consultations with private companies in the creative and cultural sector it is apparent that more support and guidance is needed for companies to effectively monitor diversity. Because of the small size of many companies working in the creative industries this may well need to be led by industry and professional bodies and supported by publicly funded bodies such as Regional Development Agencies.

**England’s Black, Asian and minority ethnic workforce**

The rapid growth of the creative and cultural industries has taken place in parallel with marked demographic shifts in the UK’s population. A Cabinet Office report in 2003 mapped the impact of generational change in Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) communities and their presence in the labour force and painted a picture of an ageing indigenous population, with minority ethnic groups increasingly dominating the working age population of the UK.\(^{15}\) It predicted that over the next twenty years ethnic minorities will account for around three quarters of the growth in the potential workforce.\(^{16}\) In 2007 11.9% of England’s working-age population were BAME.\(^{17}\) In London, where almost one third of the creative and cultural industries are based, over a third of the working age population is from minority ethnic groups. Table 1 (opposite) sets out the BAME population in each Government Office region in England in 2007.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Government Office region</th>
<th>% of BAME population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North East</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yorkshire and The Humber</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Midlands</td>
<td>8.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Midlands</td>
<td>14.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East</td>
<td>7.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>35.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South East</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South West</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>11.9</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Measuring and understanding under-representation**

Most government departments and agencies set minority ethnic recruitment targets related to official population figures. These targets provide clear goals for where the organisation wants to be and can be used to drive incremental progress. While less documentation is publicly available for the private sector, the approach of some banks, for example Lloyds TSB, is often held up as an example of best practice in diversity. Lloyds TSB employs diversity ‘dashboards’ that show the demographic profile of its workforce compared to local demographics and sets aspirational goals for BAME representation.\(^{18}\)

The Cabinet Office’s 10-point diversity plan was launched in 2005 following a review of diversity and equality in employment across the Civil Service. The plan set a target of 4% ethnic minority representation in the Senior Civil Service by 2008, requiring a 1.2% increase from actual

---

\(^{15}\) Cabinet Office (2003), *Ethnic Minorities and the Labour Market*


\(^{17}\) APS, 2008

\(^{18}\) [www.lloydstsb.com/about_ltsb/equality_and_diversity_page.asp#race](http://www.lloydstsb.com/about_ltsb/equality_and_diversity_page.asp#race)
representation in 2005 (2.8%). The plan also set targets for female representation (30%) and for disabled employees (3.2%) in senior positions. See Table 2, above.

Targets were also set for the next two most senior grades: 5.7% for Grades 6 and 7 and 6.7% for Senior and Higher Executive Officers. See Table 4, opposite. The Cabinet Office publishes progress towards these targets every six months. The new diversity strategy for the Civil Service, Promoting Equality and Valuing Diversity, aims to build on the achievements of the 10-point plan and reflects a drive to attempt to mainstream equality and diversity in every aspect of the Service’s work.19

As part of its Race Equality Scheme, Arts Council England set targets for recruitment and the workforce profile, including regional targets and targets for those in senior positions. See Table 3, above. These targets are aligned to relevant census data according to the location of the office.

---

### Table 2: Senior Civil Service diversity targets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-sector</th>
<th>Oct 2003 (baseline)</th>
<th>April 2005</th>
<th>2008 Target</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>27.5%</td>
<td>27.8%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women in top management posts</td>
<td>23.9%</td>
<td>24.4%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAME</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disabled</td>
<td>2.1%</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 3: Arts Council England workforce diversity targets 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>2001 UK Census BAME</th>
<th>Proposed target for overall BAME staff by 2008</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>East</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Midlands</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Office</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North East</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South East</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South West</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Midlands</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yorkshire</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level 2 and above</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Many central, local and government agency targets are generally based on national averages, which can mask high levels of under-representation in areas with high concentrations of ethnic minority populations. For example, while the percentage of the working age population that is BAME nationally is 11.9%, in London it represents over 35% of the working age population.20 In some cities and specific wards across the country, minority ethnic populations are even higher and occasionally constitute the majority of the local population. Meeting a target that is based on the national average but in a London labour force context can highlight serious issues of under-representation with regard to the ethnic make-up of the local population.

Addressing under-representation should not be understood as simply working towards a workforce that has exactly the same profile as the wider population. The aim is that individuals have equal access to employment and that organisations are employing from the widest pool of talent available. Monitoring ethnicity provides a measure for organisations to understand how representative they are of the working age population, the labour pool available, and to reflect and act on recruitment, training and retention policies and practices.

**Workforce profile of the creative and cultural industries**

The government recognises the importance of a strong evidence base to monitor and support the development of the creative and cultural sector. In addition to the economic and structural mapping studies conducted by the Work Foundation, National Endowment for Science, Technology and the Arts (NESTA) and the DCMS Creative Economy Programme, Creative & Cultural Skills have produced detailed research on the creative and cultural workforce in the form of the Creative Blueprint and a creative and cultural sector Footprint. The Footprint uses data from the Annual Population Survey (formerly the Labour Force Survey) and is one of the first documents to robustly benchmark workforce diversity in the sector.21 It provides a breakdown for each sub-sector by gender, disability and ethnicity. See Table 4, above.

20 APS, 2008
21 Creative & Cultural Skills Footprint, 2007
The footprint found very little variation, with BAME representation ranging from 3% to 5.3% across the sub-sectors. These figures represent the overall percentage of those in all occupations and jobs in the sector and do not provide a breakdown by grade or leadership.

The data shows a consistent pattern of under-representation when compared to the national average (11.9%) of the BAME working age population. This is even starker in sub-sectors that are concentrated in London, where ethnic minorities constitute 35% of the working population. For example, 70% of advertising businesses are based in London but only 5.3% of the advertising workforce is of BAME background.

### Government department and agencies

DCMS is the government department responsible for government policy on the arts, sport, National Lottery, tourism, libraries, museums and galleries, broadcasting, creative industries (including music), press freedom and regulation, licensing, gambling and the historic environment. DCMS is supported in its role by Arts Council England, which is the key policy and delivery body for the arts in England, and the Museums, Libraries and Archives Council (MLA), which provides strategic leadership in England and collaborates with partners across the UK. Creative & Cultural Skills is the sector skills council for advertising, crafts, cultural heritage, design, music and the arts and acts as a bridge between industry, education and government. This section provides an overview of staff numbers by ethnicity and grade for each of these organisations.

#### Table 5: Percentage of BAME staff in senior positions at DCMS in 2007

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Total Staff</th>
<th>BAME Staff</th>
<th>BAME %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Senior Civil Service</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>8.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Grade A is the former Grade 6 & 7 equivalent to Deputy Director, Assistant Director or Policy Manager. Grade B is the equivalent of Senior Executive Officer.

Source: ONS, Commissioned Table Sept 08

The target for BAME representation in the Senior Civil Service for 2006 was 3.6% and the aim of the Cabinet Office Diversity Plan was to have 4% minority ethnic representation in the Senior Civil Service.

---

22 Staff totals are rounded and BAME numbers are unavailable. The figures are for permanent employees only.

23 There are 25 Sector Skills Councils (SSCs). Each one represents five to seven related industries. SSCs were licensed by the Secretary of State for Education and Skills, in consultation with Ministers in Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland. Their objective is to tackle the skills needs of the UK. Re-licensing will occur in 2008 once the new Commission for Employment and Skills is established. SSCs receive substantial public investment and lead dialogue with government departments across the UK. This enables organisations and employers, via SSCs, to have a far greater impact on policies affecting skills and productivity. www.ccskills.org.uk/about
Service by 2008. In 2005/06 there was just one Senior Civil Servant from a BAME background representing 2.9% of Civil Servants in the department. This is below the 3.6% target set for 2006 by the Cabinet Office and significantly below average representation. BAME representation increased to 3.7% in 2007. While DCMS exceeds the Cabinet Office targets for minority ethnic representation in Grade A & B positions, the figures are still below the working age average for England and well below the percentage for London where the bulk of the BAME population resides.

DCMS is responsible for over 600 Ministerial appointments to 60 public boards and makes more than 100 appointments and reappointments each year. These include organisations such as Arts Council England, MLA, British Library, British Museum, Imperial War Museum, Museum of Science and Industry in Manchester, National Maritime Museum and Tate. Its Annual Public Appointments Plan includes targets to increase the diversity of its appointments along with detailed action plans for achievement. These targets are 50% women, 10% from minority ethnic backgrounds and 6% disabled people. Table 6 sets out the percentage of BAME board appointments to DCMS funded bodies in 2005/06.

DCMS has an advisory group on increasing diversity of boards and has made considerable progress in diversifying board representation. Only 2.1% of those in post in September 1997 were from an minority ethnic background, but this had risen to 6.6% by September 2000, and 7.9% by September 2001 (the Whitehall average is 5.6%). The DCMS Equality Scheme notes that: “the recent slight dip for first-term appointments shows the need to work hard to sustain this performance.”

**12.8% of senior Arts Council England staff are from BAME backgrounds, 1% above the average for the working age BAME population.**

### Arts Council England

Arts Council England is the national development agency for the arts in England, distributing public money from government and the National Lottery. Championing diversity is one of the Arts Council’s core ambitions. It wants to encourage an environment where the arts reflect the full range and diversity of contemporary English society. Internally the diversity team in the national office leads this initiative but all regions and departments take part in this work.

The Arts Council has worked consistently over the last few years to ensure that its 884 strong workforce is more reflective of the ethnic diversity of England’s population and delivers the recruitment target of 15% set as part of its

| Table 6: Percentage of BAME board appointments to DCMS funded bodies in 2005/06 |
|---------------------------------|-----------|-----------|
|                                 | Total     | BAME%     |
| Number in post                  | 508       | 8.3       |
| Number of appointments 2005/06  | 123       | 9.8       |
| Number of 1st appointments      | 73        | 8.2       |
| Number of reappointments        | 50        | 12        |

---

24 Cabinet Office, 2005  
25 DCMS, 2006  
26 These include three public corporations, two public broadcasting authorities, one executive agency and 55 Non Departmental Public Bodies (NDPBs). DCMS Equality Scheme 2007-2010, 2006  
27 A full list of sponsored bodies can be found on the DCMS website: www.culture.gov.uk/922.aspx  
28 DCMS (2002), Race Equality Scheme  
29 Ibid, p. 35  
30 As at April 2007
Race Equality Scheme. This strategic approach has been effective and the 15.4% BAME workforce across the Arts Council now exceeds the England BAME working age population average by 3.5%. See Table 7, above. In the National and London offices BAME staff make up 27.0% and 20.6% of the workforce respectively. In senior positions (above Level 2) this is still above the England working population average at 11.9%.

Museums, Libraries and Archives Council

The Museums, Libraries and Archives Council (MLA) is an agency for museums, galleries, libraries and archives working to deliver strategic leadership in England and nine UK regions. Sponsored by DCMS, MLA was launched as the strategic body working with and for the museums, archives and libraries sector and has been committed to promoting diversity and equality. MLA employs 76 staff in the UK with an approximate annual turnover of £65 million. MLA has eight BAME staff out of a staff complement of 76 (10.5%), of which two are in middle management grades.

Creative & Cultural Skills

Creative & Cultural Skills, the sector skills agency for the creative and cultural sector across the UK, was founded in 2004 and employs 53 staff and has a turnover of £5 million per year. 21% of its total staff, 22% of its managers and 8% of its board are from BAME backgrounds.

Arts sector

The arts sector includes performing and visual arts, combined arts, literature and music. In addition to its policy role Arts Council England is responsible for providing regular funding to almost 900 arts organisations in England as well as smaller project grants to individuals and organisations. The Arts Council also invests money in developing the arts sector in partnership with other agencies and organisations. It will be investing some £350 million a year in Regularly Funded Organisations (RFOs) by 2010/11. RFOs include organisations such as the English National Ballet, London Symphony Orchestra, the Institute of Contemporary Arts, the West Yorkshire Playhouse, the Royal Shakespeare Company and the Birmingham Repertory Theatre, as well as several high profile BAME-led organisations such as...
as the Akram Khan Dance Company, Nitro, Talawa Theatre Company, Tamasha Theatre Company and the Drum.

It is the aspiration of many arts organisations to achieve RFO status and they form the bedrock of a wide range of artistic and cultural activity. However, music and literature sectors have fewer RFOs and the major literature and music publishing houses and companies do not receive regular Arts Council funding. There are also other high profile cultural organisations that do not receive Arts Council funding: the Barbican only recently became an RFO when it partnered with the Arts Council on its contemporary music programme.

As part of their funding agreement RFOs are required to perform a workforce audit that covers race, disability and gender by employment status. Table 8 above provides an overview of the RFO workforce.

These figures indicate that representation in managerial positions is comparable to England’s working age BAME population at just over 10%. It is important to note that there is a significant difference between the percentage of BAME managers and the percentage of total staff that are BAME. In some sub-sectors BAME managers and staff are more likely to be in contracted rather than permanent positions. This is particularly acute in music and literature RFOs where there are 15% and 9% discrepancies respectively. Visual arts and combined arts are the only artforms to have RFOs with a higher percentage of BAME permanent managers than contractors. However, visual arts RFOs are also the least ethnically diverse overall. Combined arts RFOs are the most ethnically diverse, followed by music.

BAME representation on RFO boards is 3% higher than England’s BAME working age population. This is important as board members provide critical leadership and direction to RFOs and the sector as a whole. However, it emerged from interviews and focus groups that many BAME leaders may sit on a number of boards and so

Table 8: RFO BAME workforce profile 2006-07

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Performing</th>
<th>Visual</th>
<th>Literature</th>
<th>Music</th>
<th>Combined</th>
<th>SUN</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BAME led (%)</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>5.7%</td>
<td>12.7%</td>
<td>12.1%</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
<td>6.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAME led (number)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Board members</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanent managers</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contractual managers</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total managers</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total staff</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SUN = Service, umbrella, and network organisations

Source: Arts Council England, 2007

there may be substantial double or even triple counting in this figure.

While the workforce figures are promising, the results for BAME-led organisations are mixed. In 2006/07 6.3% of all RFOs were BAME-led. However, this figure varies significantly by artform. For example, 12.7% of RFOs with a music focus are BAME-led compared to only 2.6% of performing arts RFOs. After combined arts (12.1%), BAME-led organisations drop to 5.7% in literature and then below 4% for the visual arts, performing arts and service, umbrella and networking (SUN) organisations.

The percentage of BAME-led organisations in performing arts is of particular concern as the artform is in receipt of the largest amount of funding from the Arts Council – almost £150 million per year. The eight BAME-led organisations in this area receive an average £203,000 in funding compared to an average of some £500,000 received by the other 295 organisations.

The three areas with the highest percentage of BAME-led organisations, namely music, combined arts and literature, receive £83 million, £36 million and £6 million respectively. Although, at £83 million music is the second largest artform in terms of RFO funding, the Arts Council plays a relatively small role in the industry and the funding is concentrated. The top 25 music organisations receive 89% of the funding, leaving £9 million with the remaining 94 organisations. Only one of the top 25 music RFOs in terms of funding was BAME-led in 2007. The Arts Council’s investment of around £6 million a year in 69 literature organisations again represents only a fraction of the wider commercial industry.

Museums, libraries and archives

Museums and galleries

There have been a number of attempts to map the museums workforce in the UK including identifying diversity in senior positions. In 1998 a survey found that less than 2% of museum staff working with and presenting collections were from ethnic minorities. The Mayor’s Commission on African and Asian Heritage (MCAAH) surveyed national museums based in London and this survey was updated in 2006. The most up-to-date figures are from the Museum Libraries and Archive Council’s (MLA) recent mapping exercise which forms part of a wider diversity programme to meet the requirements of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act.

As Table 9 opposite shows, only 3.3% of strategic and operations managers are BAME and BAME staff form 4.4% and 4.5% of middle managers and specialist staff respectively. This is in contrast to the percentage of administrative staff (10.5%) and frontline staff (12.5%) who are BAME. National museums are considerably more diverse than hub museums (see Tables 10 and 11 opposite). However, it should be noted that 10 out of 13 of these are based in London where one third of the potential workforce is BAME.

10.2% of managers and 14.9% of board members in England’s RFOs are from BAME backgrounds.

The data is available publicly at: www.research.mla.gov.uk/WFD/
The figures nevertheless indicate progress and are a cause for optimism in the sector. In 2006 the MCAAH found that only 1.2% of senior management and 10.9% of all staff in London’s national museums were from BAME backgrounds (see Table 12 overleaf). Similarly, in 2005 a national survey of 45 hub museums by the Museums Association found that only 1.3% of senior managers were from BAME backgrounds (see Table 13 overleaf). While these surveys were based on different methodologies, it is still possible to infer that current figures broadly represent a 1% to 2% increase in BAME representation in senior management in hub museums and a 3% to 4% increase in England’s national museums.

### Table 9: Ethnicity and level of staff in national and hub museums in England

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strategic/operations management</th>
<th>Middle managers</th>
<th>Specialist staff</th>
<th>Admin</th>
<th>Front line staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>96.6%</td>
<td>95.5%</td>
<td>95.4%</td>
<td>89.7%</td>
<td>87.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAME</td>
<td>3.3%</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
<td>4.5%</td>
<td>10.5%</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: MLA, 2008

### Table 10: Ethnicity and level of staff in hub museums in England

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strategic/operations management</th>
<th>Middle managers</th>
<th>Specialist staff</th>
<th>Admin</th>
<th>Front line staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>98.0%</td>
<td>96.7%</td>
<td>96.5%</td>
<td>94.7%</td>
<td>95.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAME</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>3.3%</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
<td>5.3%</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: MLA, 2008

### Table 11: Ethnicity and level of staff in national museums in England

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Strategic/operations management</th>
<th>Middle managers</th>
<th>Specialist staff</th>
<th>Admin</th>
<th>Front line staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>95.4%</td>
<td>94.6%</td>
<td>94.5%</td>
<td>86.5%</td>
<td>78.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAME</td>
<td>4.5%</td>
<td>5.4%</td>
<td>5.5%</td>
<td>13.6%</td>
<td>22.1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: MLA, 2008
Table 12: BAME representation in London’s national museums and galleries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Museum or gallery</th>
<th>Staff</th>
<th>Overall BAME %</th>
<th>Senior managers</th>
<th>BAME %</th>
<th>Board members</th>
<th>BAME %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National Portrait Gallery</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Museum</td>
<td>915</td>
<td>18.5</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liverpool Museums</td>
<td>616</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tate</td>
<td>738</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Museums London</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Museum of London in Docklands</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V&amp;A</td>
<td>694</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nat Maritime</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Museum</td>
<td>441</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>3857</td>
<td><strong>10.9</strong></td>
<td><strong>154</strong></td>
<td><strong>1.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>140</strong></td>
<td><strong>10.7</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Mayor’s Commission on Asian and African Heritage, updated 2006

Table 13: BAME representation in the museum workforce

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Curators</th>
<th>Senior managers</th>
<th>Total workforce</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>95.2%</td>
<td>97.5%</td>
<td>95.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAME</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Museums Association, 2005

Libraries

There were nearly 300 million visits to England’s 3,494 public libraries last year alone. Libraries are recognised for their work on access through outreach and in-reach programmes as well as in diversifying collections and in-library events.

However, workforce diversity development lags behind this excellent work. The most recent Library Workforce Survey, conducted in 2005, showed that within the library workforce 7.7% of staff were of BAME background. Local authority libraries have considerably less BAME representation in their workforce at 3.9%.

There are very few BAME staff in the sector at professional levels. Only 2.3% of the membership of The Chartered Institute for Library and Information Professionals (CILIP) are from BAME backgrounds. The Society of Chief Librarians does not currently monitor ethnicity, although there are plans to do so for their next membership renewal.

---

37 Library Workforce Survey, 2005
38 CILIP is the Chartered Institute of Library and Information Professionals is the leading professional body for librarians, information specialists and knowledge managers. CILIP forms a community of around 36,000 people engaged in library and information work, of which approximately 21,000 are CILIP members and about 15,000 are regular customers of CILIP Enterprises. www.cilip.org.uk
39 The Society of Chief Librarians (SCL) is a local government association made up of the chief librarian of each library authority in England, Wales and Northern Ireland. SCL takes a leading role in the development of public libraries.
Librarians does not currently monitor ethnicity, although there are plans to do so for their next membership renewal.

Archives
There are an estimated 2,000 archives in the UK run by national archive institutions, local authority archive services, universities, libraries and museums. Some businesses and charities also maintain and provide public access to their archives as do some private and specialist institutions.

No data on the ethnicity of the archive workforce was available until 2007 when Lifelong Learning UK and the MLA mapped the workforce. The survey of the sector found that 95.6% of the workforce is white. While the report disaggregates disability by level and full and part-time working, this is not done for ethnicity so it is difficult to assess the number of BAME staff at senior levels. However, outside London the picture is often relatively monocultural. In the West Midlands a recent survey found that 98.5% of the workforce was white, constituting 85.5% of the local working age population.

The Society of Archivists, the principal professional body for archivists, archive conservators and records managers in the United Kingdom and Ireland, does not currently monitor membership by ethnicity although there are plans to do this for the next membership renewal.

The National Archives (TNA) provides the only available data on senior management within the archive sector. TNA was created in 2003 though the merger of the Public Record Office and the Historical Manuscripts Commission. It is involved in setting standards and supporting innovation in information and records management across the UK, as well as providing a practical framework of best practice for opening up and encouraging the reuse of public sector information.

Under its Race Equality Scheme TNA monitors ethnicity and staff grades, which are reported yearly in its annual report. As at March 2005, 2.5% of the senior management band were from BAME backgrounds, well below the 11% target. The total BAME workforce was 19.1%, but this was concentrated (37.9%) in administrative and front of house posts.

Creative industries and private sector
In the private sector, outside of some limited data that can be drawn from the Annual Population Survey, professional membership bodies and networks have undertaken the most useful work. These surveys have sometimes been for a particular purpose and limited in scope. However, in the absence of other data, they form a useful starting point.

From the 1960s onwards the Institute of Practitioners in Advertising (IPA) has undertaken a yearly census of its members that provides a useful tool for mapping year-on-year change in the sector. The census records the profile of the sector in relation to age, gender and ethnicity. In 2007 it found that 6.1% of employees of IPA agencies were from a BAME background, up from 5.1% in 2004. While the census looks at

40 Simon Matty (2004), Overview of Data in the MLA Sector, MLA, p. 96
41 LLUK and MLA (2007), Profile of the Archives Workforce in England
42 Ibid.
43 www.connectinghistories.org.uk/guidance/how_to_work_in_heritage.asp
44 www.archives.org.uk/
45 The last two annual reports have only listed the percentage of ethnic minority staff as a whole, not by position as required by the Race Equality Scheme. The BAME workforce dropped down to 18.2% in 2006-07.
46 IPA (2008), Agency Census 2007 – a report on employment in IPA member agencies
gender by level in the organisation, it does not do the same for ethnicity. The survey has also suffered from non-completion of the ethnicity section by agencies. In 2007 only 67 of the 127 respondents provided information. The results are also limited to IPA members only.\textsuperscript{47}

In 2004, Arts Council England and the Diversity in Publishing Network (DipNet), in association with the Bookseller, researched the cultural diversity of the publishing industry. It found that 13\% of the workforce is BAME and that only 8\% of professionals in the industry believe the industry is culturally diverse.\textsuperscript{48} This was followed up by a more detailed survey in 2007 which found that the workforce was 7.7\% BAME and included only 4\% of editorial staff and 3\% at director level of BAME background.\textsuperscript{49}

There has been no significant initiative to date to map the cultural diversity of the music industry or design industry outside of the Creative & Cultural Skills Footprint. The National Music Council recommended that this be a priority for the sector in 2004 and the Alliance for Diversity in Music and Management is keen that this is addressed.

In order to augment the limited amount of private sector data available from the above sources a survey of private sector companies was undertaken as part of this study. Initial steps included compiling a database of creative organisations covering the publishing, music, design and advertising industries. An extensive desktop research exercise identified over 300 companies. This database was supplemented by a database of creative businesses in England with more than 15 employees from the National Business Database supplied by Experian. Over 780 company details were supplied, and in total the database consisted of over 1080 companies. Companies were initially informed of the study via email, and letter.

The survey covered:

- Main focus/activity of business
- Local/regional/national focus
- Size of business: employees
- Size of business: approximate turnover
- Ethnicity of ownership/directors
- Minority ethnic representation at executive or senior management level, permanent/contracted
- BAME board representation

In terms of follow up to encourage response:

- Over 365 companies were contacted via telephone to inform them of the survey. If the company was interested in participating, an email with a document outlining the study with the survey was sent. In total over 260 follow up emails were sent.
- Follow-up letters were sent out to the 780 companies. If a response was received, an email with the survey attached was sent. Follow up phone calls were also made to encourage survey return.
- Out of 365 companies contacted through follow up telephone calls 260 received the surveys via email; 13 companies returned completed surveys.
- A further six agreed to a face-to-face or telephone interview and three participated in

\textsuperscript{47} As of 2007 there were 261 IPA member agencies, representing 19,877 individuals. 159 of these are based in London and account for 78.3\% of the employed base. (IPA Census 2007)

\textsuperscript{48} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{49} ‘Industry diversity uncovered’, The Bookseller, 13 April 2007
interviews. These interviews focused on a) leadership support, development opportunities and provision b) specific strategies to increase employment diversity and c) key barriers to minority ethnic representation in the sector.

Common responses included:

- a perceived lack of time or resources to participate
- scepticism about the potential benefits of engaging with the survey
- a general expression of disinterest in the study

Some thought that the study was an exercise in political correctness. The response rate appears to be indicative of a broad problem with surveys, including surveys conducted by membership organisations. The IPA, for example, conducted an census of its members in 2004 in which only 92 agencies (out of 237 taking part) were prepared to offer information on their ethnic breakdown, though the response had improved by 2007 to 67 out of 127 agencies.50

Of the 13 companies that responded:

- 140 out of 2,168 staff were BAME (6%)
- 13 out of 176 managers were BAME (7%)
- 17 out of 93 board members were BAME (18%)
- 7 out of 108 of directors were BAME (6%)
- 12 out of the 13 had a formal equality and/or diversity policy (92%)
- 5 out of 13 had a diversity action plan (38%)
- 6 out of 13 had formal ethnic monitoring systems (46%)
- 3 out of 13 provided diversity training for staff (23%)

Those that responded and were willing to participate appeared to be aware of the under-representation of BAME groups within the creative industries and were taking steps to improve the situation as they could see the potential benefits. It can safely be assumed that companies that responded had an active interest in the diversity issue and that these indicators are likely to be far more positive than for the sector as a whole.

Companies that were interested were followed up with qualitative interviews to allow us to gain more in depth insights into diversity/equalities issues and initiatives. In total four qualitative interviews were undertaken with creative companies and one interview with a membership organisation. Companies that were engaged with diversity were usually well informed about the under representation of BAME peoples within the creative private sector and had taken initiatives to improve the situation within their own company and their locality; furthermore they were aware of the need for a holistic and collective industry response to the issue.

One publishing company felt that the industry came across as ‘cagey’ and lacked the transparency needed to attract people from BAME backgrounds. One way in which the company was attempting to improve BAME uptake was by going into schools in its locality in order to encourage children from disadvantaged backgrounds (this often equated to children from BAME backgrounds) to inform them about the publishing industry and how they can get involved. These projects could be seen as underpinned by a concern by some companies to respond to the corporate social responsibility
(CSR) agenda and is likely to be medium and longer term in generating positive impacts on the workforce profile.

In line with these outreach approaches there were also more directed and rigorous recruitment strategies in place such as advertising in the Bookseller, Guardian Media and other newspapers. However, these strategies can be seen as mainstream and attempting to attract BAME people in very indirect ways. Virtually none of the companies contacted had specific campaigns to target BAME people. One possible reason for this could be misunderstanding of the distinction between positive action and positive discrimination, with companies fearful of being seen as positively discriminating in order to improve the diversity of their workforce.

Some creative companies use recruitment consultants such as Rare to recruit employees from BAME backgrounds. Rare Recruitment attempts to connect exceptional people from diverse backgrounds with jobs in leading organisations and the publishing company Random House Group (RHG) is one of its clients. In February 2008 Random House consulted Rare Recruitment to find a publishing assistant to work on Tamarind Books, an acquired imprint that focuses on books for minority ethnic children.\(^\text{51}\)

RHG also has a number of other initiatives to improve BAME representation within the organisation and to widen its consumer base. It supports a number of literacy initiatives including World Book Day and Quick Reads (short, fast paced books by bestselling writers). RHG sees this as an initiative that reaches out to wider audiences, particular those who may be put off by reading long books or may have English as a second language.

They also run a number of workshops, have speakers in school assemblies from the company, and careers days in schools within the locality (East London) to show children that there are no barriers to entry. It is also part of the Merlin Initiative (which identifies role models for BAME children) and runs a series of breakfast clubs with a local school. RHG made the suggestion that improving BAME uptake in publishing should include dealing with children’s misconceptions that are acting as barriers to entry, such as the industry being expensive to enter or a requiring extensive study prior to entry. The respondent felt that this was not just an issue for their business but that the whole industry has to do more to ensure it reaches out to more diverse audiences.

There is also a felt need to connect education provision more closely with the publishing industry in order to ensure that a diverse range of people enter and are retained within the industry, although RHG emphasised that it does not have a major problem with retention but needs to focus on getting more BAME people into the company.

In the qualitative interviews there were calls for challenging management styles and structures in the industry that were felt to be laden with prejudices and misconceptions. One respondent suggested that it was important to roll out diversity initiatives to management in order to tackle any prejudices that they may hold and to change attitudes towards diversity at the top.

However, there are also specific one-off examples of initiatives driven from the top. A notable example is that of Lynda Brockbank, the creative director of the design company Crescent Lodge, who sponsored Haroon Mirza’s Masters degree in...
fine art at the Chelsea College of Art and Design. Her rationale was simple: ‘ethnic minorities in Britain don’t seem to get a look-in, so I thought I could help to pay for one £6,000 scholarship for a home ethnic minority student. Haroon got it.’

However, despite the sponsorship and work experience placements for students from a variety of backgrounds, Lynda Brockbank stated that the company had never had an applicant from a BAME background. The perceived barriers she saw included a lack of belief that design companies will employ people from BAME backgrounds, design courses appearing to be expensive, and a lack of parental inspiration for young people to go into the design industry. A possible suggestion for improving uptake, in line with the suggestions of those in the publishing industry, include reaching out to young people at universities and college in order to inform them about the opportunities and make them feel welcome.

The motivations for addressing diversity issues also tended to be closely allied with perceived immediate and practical business considerations. For example, one publishing company noted the widely publicised potential benefits of entering the market for minority ethnic audiences. However, these benefits would have to be underpinned by practical consideration of economic benefit for the company. In practice these were seen as minimal due to a perceived saturation in the minority ethnic publishing sector.

**Creative entrepreneurs: freelancing and self-employment in the sector**

Leaders are not only located in large organisations. The role of freelancers and sole traders is vital to the sector and this needs to be taken into account when looking at individuals who are leaders or have leadership abilities. There is also a large body of evidence that points to higher levels of self-employment among minority ethnic groups for a wide range of reasons, including anticipated and real experience of discrimination in the paid employment sector. For this reason we looked at the following data on the creative and cultural sector from the 2005/06 Annual Population Survey:

- Sole directors of limited businesses
- Running a business or professional practice
- Working for self
- Freelance

Only 3.3% of sole directors in the creative and cultural sector are ‘BAME or other’, as are 5.5% of those running a business or professional practice in the sector. A larger proportion, 7.6%, of those individuals in the sector working for themselves are BAME/other and 5.5% of freelancers are BAME/other. (See Table 14, overleaf). In London this increases substantially to 18.7% running a business and 15.5% working for self, although the percentage of freelancers is the same across the country. (See Table 15, overleaf).

Table 16 (overleaf) shows that as a percentage of all BAME individuals in the sector who receive payment for employment other than from an employer, only 2.3% are sole directors compared to 4.7% for all white creative and cultural sector workers. White individuals are also more likely to be running a business at 13.2%, compared to 11% of BAME and other ethnicities.

Consultations with BAME leaders in the sector found that many are likely to work for

---

52 [www.independent.co.uk/news/education/higher/british-universities-are-waking-up-to-the-idea-of-ustyle-fundraising-917723.html](http://www.independent.co.uk/news/education/higher/british-universities-are-waking-up-to-the-idea-of-ustyle-fundraising-917723.html)

53 Cabinet Office, 2003, p. 24

54 The figures from the Annual Population Survey 2005-06 are a composite of the creative industries due to the low sample sizes of the survey, particularly for analysis of ethnicity by sub-sector. Some have also been grouped, or sample sizes are not significant. Due to its size, London is the only regional sub-sector that can offer some useful data on BAME roles within the sector.
themselves or set up their own business due to experiences of discrimination and lack of opportunity when working in institutions or for another employer. This is supported by the evidence from the Annual Population Survey (APS), which suggests that BAME leaders in the creative and cultural sector are more likely to be working for themselves: 62.5% compared to 52.6% for those of white British ethnicity.

For those in the sector who do work for an employer, the APS survey found that 5.4% of managers in the industry are recorded as BAME/other. This is in line with minority ethnic employment for the sector which Creative & Cultural Skills estimates to be 5%.55

**Conclusions**

- All the available data corroborates the commonly held view in the creative and cultural sector that BAME individuals are under-represented at senior levels. However, the profile of the sector varies considerably. By highlighting both the differences and the areas where there appears to have been progress, the figures demonstrate the need for more robust data upon which to make sector-wide assessments.

- The arts sector in particular has demonstrated considerable progress on race equality. While this is the first attempt to benchmark BAME leadership in the sector, the progress in overall workforce profile is apparent when comparing current figures with past data. For example, a

---

**Table 14:** Ethnicity of those who receive payment for employment other than from an employer in the creative and cultural industries in England

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>BAME/other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sole director of own ltd business</td>
<td>3.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Running a business or professional practice</td>
<td>5.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working for self</td>
<td>7.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freelance work</td>
<td>5.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>6.9%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Annual Population Survey, 2006

**Table 15:** Ethnicity of those who receive payment for employment other than from an employer in the creative and cultural industries in London

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>BAME/other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Running a business or professional practice</td>
<td>18.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working for self</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freelance work</td>
<td>5.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>13.0%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Annual Population Survey, 2006

**Table 16:** Breakdown of types of activity for white and BAME individuals who receive payment for employment other than from an employer in the creative and cultural industries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>White</th>
<th>BAME</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sole directors</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Running a business or professional practice</td>
<td>13.2%</td>
<td>11.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freelance</td>
<td>29.6%</td>
<td>24.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working for self</td>
<td>52.6%</td>
<td>62.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Annual Population Survey, 2006
survey by Arts Council England in 1998 found that of 2,009 permanently employed staff in English regional theatres 1,929 were white (96%), and out of 463 board members, 440 (96.5%) were white. In the performing arts 17% of staff in RFOs and 15% of board members are now of BAME background. The figure for managers is 10%, more than double the figure for all staff in 1998.

Arts Council England has been undertaking developmental work over a number of years that has produced quantifiable results. The Museums, Libraries and Archives Council has in the last few years prioritised the issue, recently undertaking a comprehensive diversity mapping exercise of national and hub museums to establish its workforce profile. Its pioneering work with the Museums Association to deliver the Diversify programme has demonstrated good results.

The libraries and archives sub-sectors are now taking a lead from the work being done in the museums sector and beginning to focus on diversity monitoring and development initiatives. However, they have considerable work to do to create an evidence base and address under-representation in professional and senior positions. Only 4.4% of the total archive workforce and only 2.3% of library professionals are of BAME background. Libraries are widely seen as having led the sector on equality of access issues and now need to show the same commitment and development in relation to workforce development.

The numbers show that in every sub-sector there is considerably less representation in senior than in administrative and other positions. Data for total BAME staff representation in both Arts Council England and MLA suggests that there is a high level of interest from BAME communities in working in the arts and cultural sector, and recruitment at lower levels in these organisations often reflects more closely the local working age BAME populations. The issue therefore is why these individuals in entry-level jobs (administration, frontline) are not progressing to higher levels. The data suggests that institutions need to focus more attention on the retention, career development plans and progression routes for BAME staff that are currently concentrated in lower level positions.

There is limited data on the creative industries such as advertising and design, but figures that are available show that overall diversity profiles are still well below the working age average, as do the composite figures on those who are running their own business or freelancing in the sector. The fact that more BAME individuals working in the creative and cultural sector work for themselves than the average is not surprising given our consultations with leaders in the sector. It is widely felt that their experiences in mainstream organisations had led them to going it alone.
4 the case for Black, Asian and minority ethnic leadership

The legal, moral and business cases for diversity are relatively well established in the public sector and in many large organisations in the private sector.

More recently, a creative case for diversity has emerged. The Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 provides the legal framework for action in relation to racial and ethnic discrimination in the UK. The importance of eliminating racial inequality and ensuring equal opportunities for all and a level playing field in employment is explicit in the Act which also recognises the case for positive action in training and development opportunities to address under-representation.56 The implementation of the Act is underpinned by the Equalities and Human Rights Commission57.

The business case for diversity

The business case for diversity is supported by an increasing amount of research on the benefits of a diverse workforce. The European Commission’s 2005 study, The Business Case for Diversity: Good Practices in the Workplace, based on a survey of almost 1,000 companies across Europe, found that the most important benefits for businesses were perceived to be enhanced employee recruitment and retention from a larger pool of high quality workers, improved corporate image and reputation, greater innovation and enhanced market opportunities.58 The business imperative is also recognised by business support agencies such as the London Development Agency. Its Diversity Works programme champions the business case for diversity and aims to support businesses in London in diversifying their workforce and supply chains to ensure that London retains its competitive edge in the global market.59

A dynamic and diverse workforce profile has become an important component in changing business practices. In an age of globalisation businesses are finding it important to have a workforce that reflects the communities that they are imbedded in and the markets and segments they aim to attract. The Confederation of

56 The Race Relations Act recognises that because of the past discrimination or disadvantage people from particular racial groups may not have fully recognised their potential and may not have the qualifications or experience to make them eligible for particular work. Positive action under section 37 (1) of the Race Relations Act 1976 allows for targeted training programmes or encouragement if it can be demonstrated that at any time in the previous 12 months there were no persons of a racial group doing particular work within Great Britain, or that the proportion of that racial group in the population of Great Britain as a whole. Then, it is lawful to provide access to training or to encourage and help members of the under-represented groups to undertake such work.

57 The Commission has produced a number of guidelines with practical steps on how to achieve and maintain workforce diversity.


59 www.diversityworks.co.uk
Business Industry (CBI) report Talent not Tokenism, which looks at the business case for diversity, suggests that the tangible benefits for businesses include:

• Increasing employee satisfaction, which helps attract new staff and retain those already there, reducing recruitment costs, and increasing productivity.

• Understanding better how the company’s diverse customers think and what drives their spending habits, or how to access markets they have not previously been able to tap into effectively.

• Finding enough workers to fill skills gaps in areas with tight labour markets, where there are not enough ‘obvious candidates’ for the vacancies they have.

The Business Link website also stresses the business case for diversity at work with diverse workforce benefits including:

• Having a wider range of resources, skills and ideas among your employees that you can tap into.

• Improving staff retention, leading to lower recruitment and training costs.

• Increasing employee efficiency and lowering stress due to cross-functional teams, i.e. employees are capable of a variety of roles due to their different backgrounds and skill sets.

• Avoiding claims of unfair treatment or discrimination.

• Building a reputation as a diverse business.

• Building a competitive edge in recruitment and retention given selection from a bigger pool of candidates.

The benefits extend far beyond the immediate workplace and have positive implications for customers and shareholders. The Business Case for Diversity and Equality report by the Department of Trade and Industry noted that:

“Businesses that take a positive approach to diversity generally are also likely to do better than their competitors. Research has also shown that organisations with high quality human resources or personnel systems – in which equality plays its part – deliver better products and services and ultimately better shareholder value.”

It should also be noted that there are a wide range of intangible benefits that may be difficult to quantify but are thought to have an impact on effectiveness. Many of these have been captured in the qualitative interviews that were undertaken for this study with companies that are active in the area of diversity.

Given the acknowledgement within the public sector and many large businesses of the positive impact diversity can have on the workforce and in taking market opportunities and improving market share, it should also be noted that some stakeholders also perceive difficulties and limitations. The Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development (CIPD) notes that there may be:

• Increased conflict among the workforce as differences in opinion make it more difficult to agree on solutions.
• Poorer internal communication, because levels of knowledge and comprehension differ between employees.

• Increased management costs that arise from dealing with potential conflict and communication problems.63

However, despite these issues, managing diversity is central to good people management in the view of the CIPD. The CIPD argues that the jury is still out on the business case for diversity, but accepts that what is clear is that different kinds of diversity can impact on organisations in different ways in different contexts and at different times, and that traditional ways of managing people and businesses may not be appropriate if organisations want to gain benefits. It also notes that the challenges to organisations in managing diversity are great and will provide rich opportunities.

The creative case for diversity

A relatively new and emerging concept in the sector is the ‘creative case’ for diversity. In introducing the Department for Culture Media and Sports’ (DCMS) overarching equality scheme, the Permanent Secretary emphasised the economic and strategic importance of diversity by saying, ‘our diversity provides us with great opportunities to enhance further the economic, sporting and cultural wealth of the nation and it was a significant factor in our winning the 2012 Olympics. We want to build on this for the future.’64

In the creative and cultural sector some see cultural diversity as a key driver of innovation, creation and output. Much of the research in this area focuses on cultural diversity and the creativity of the city. Charles Landry and Richard Florida are prominent exponents of this viewpoint and see cultural diversity as an asset that is imperative for cultural innovation in cities.65 Florida notes that ‘visible diversity serves as a signal that a community embraces the open meritocratic values of the creative age’.66 The findings and arguments of this research are widely accepted by policy makers in the creative and cultural sector. As the DCMS report Staying Ahead notes:

Creative origination is sparked by challenges to existing routines, lifestyles, protocols and ways of doing things – and where societies want to experiment with the new. London and the UK, societies which have developed the value of tolerance and openness as reactions to the early embrace of democratic institutions, overseas expansion and the pernicious impact of religious persecution, have been more ready to accommodate ‘difference’ and thus the creativity that springs from it.67

Similarly, a London Development Agency report notes:

Innovation requires diversity. No one knows where the next successful filmmaker, fashion designer or musician will come from. London’s population can offer this diversity, but developing this requires cultivating the marginal, radical or edgy, as well as the mainstream. London’s rich creative life arises out of this diversity and maintaining it means working at different levels, across sectors, neighbourhoods and policy areas.68

63 www.cipd.co.uk/subjects/dvsequi/general/diversity.htm
64 DCMS (2006), DCMS Equality Scheme 2007-2010
67 DCMS, 2007, p. 18
68 Creative London (2004), Defining our approach, LDA, p. 10
Recognising the problem

While many in the sector acknowledge the benefits of cultural diversity, achieving cultural diversity and race equality in the sector remains problematic. Although there has often been a lack of hard data to support claims, it is evident to many in the industry that ethnic minorities are under-represented in creative and cultural organisations, particularly in senior management and leadership roles.

This position is not new. The pioneering work by Naseem Khan, in The Art Britain Ignores (1976), focused on the lack of representation and understanding of the creative talents and outputs of Black and Asian artists in the UK. Since then under-representation of ethnic minorities at the top levels of creative and cultural organisations has been consistently identified as a block to progress on diversity and inclusivity, and therefore to creative, cultural and economic growth. The Greater London Authority states in its report on the creative sector that ‘despite the rhetoric about the need for a diverse workforce, it remains the case that while Black and Minority Ethnic communities comprise almost 30% of London’s population, this is not reflected in the figures for employment, ownership, company formation or wealth distribution.’

Leading figures across the sector recognise this issue and it is well documented:

Cultural diversity also ensures and enhances links with the global economy. The Greater London Authority’s report on the Asian creative industries in London states:

The Asian presence within London’s creative industries is a huge asset, with the potential to improve the competitiveness of the sector, and forge and sustain unique links between London and several of the world’s fastest growing economies, including India and China.

This diversity enables organisations to navigate and compete in increasingly globalised markets, making use of diaspora networks and cross-cultural competencies. Working across cultural boundaries is common in the sector and research evidence shows that a majority of creative companies tend to work in national and international markets, with only a quarter of the sector’s largest markets being regional or local.

However, while it is easy to lace diversity into broad public policy statements and narratives there is a danger of ignoring the need to broaden and deepen acceptance of the basic arguments across the sector. Many of the private sector companies who were contacted to take part in this study derided efforts to understand and address under-representation and diversity as either political correctness or unnecessary. There is evidently still a need to present a case to private sector creative businesses if there is to be widespread understanding of the issues to be addressed and the opportunities involved.

---

69 GLA (2003), Play it Right – Asian Creative Industries in London
70 GLA Economics (2005), London’s Creative Sector – Update
Government

DCMS’s new framework, Creative Britain: New Talents for the New Economy, stresses that through working in partnership and through its agencies it will create opportunities and pathways to support and inspire young people from all backgrounds to pursue careers in the creative sectors:

Diversity enriches our society and communities. But it is also a creative and business imperative. The creative industries suffer when they cannot draw on our creative people, whatever their ethnicity, gender or location. Yet the industries don’t always reflect that diversity in their own employment practices.\(^7\)

Advertising

David Kershaw, Chief Executive of M&C Saatchi and Chairman of the Cultural Leadership Programme, recently stated:

Another aspect of people issues is ensuring the diversity of creative talent required to make the big leaps. While there is a fairly standard profile of the recruit who comes up through art school or university, some of the great leapers I have worked with have been very different... If you want a rich spectrum of ideas, then you need to match that aspiration with the profile of the team. In the advertising sector, Diversity with a capital D is a big issue.\(^7\)

The visual arts

As part of Turning Point, its ten year strategy for the visual arts, Arts Council England commissioned research that involved 900 people representing 364 organisations:

The findings of the Warwick Report are stark and of serious concern, especially for under-represented groups and for leadership in the visual arts. In summary, there is an urgent need to address fundamental issues associated with the lack of diversity, the nature of employment, reward, career development, talent management and leadership which threaten the visual arts future health.\(^7\)

Creative and cultural sector

Tom Bewick, the Chief Executive of Creative & Cultural Skills said:

At the moment our sector does not reflect the diversity of the cultures that we’re seeking to attract. We’re not reflecting the various communities which make up London and the South East. This is an extremely exciting melting pot that we live in, yet our organisations are still predominantly very white. Not all of them, not in every area – but many are, and I think that’s one issue we need to deal with.

\(^{72}\) Arts Council England (2004), Turning point, a strategy for the contemporary visual arts in England, p. 35.
\(^{73}\) ‘Leading for Leaps’ speech at the Work Foundation in February 2008
Literature

In Full Colour, the report commissioned by the Bookseller and Arts Council England, notes that within the publishing industry:

*There is some diversity in sales, marketing and administration at lower ranks, decreasing dramatically higher up. There is virtually zero diversity in editorial... Unlike the fight for women to achieve status in the profession, the battle for cultural diversity has produced few results in the past thirty years.*

Museums and cultural heritage

The Delivering Shared Heritage report, published by the Mayor of London’s Commission on African and Asian Heritage, states that there is a fundamental need for strategic and proactive leadership to champion cultural diversity and inclusion within the heritage sector:

*The practitioners’ view, generally, was that there is a tendency for these institutions to act as a closed circle often relying on referred contacts, resulting in the exclusion of others in the recruitment process. There is also a general belief that there is a glass ceiling for staff of African and Asian descent in mainstream institutions, because Africans and Asians are likely to be pushed into roles such as community liaison positions.*

Music

There is minimal diversity in the senior management and top positions in the music industry, particularly in the major label houses. A founding member of the Alliance for Diversity in Music Management who was consulted for this report said:

*The UK music industry is second to the United States yet it is completely different in terms of its diversity among the major labels. In the United States there are a number of black record company heads and senior executives, whereas over here it is completely different. This has tangible impacts on the way in which the industry operates including an inability to market and sustain black artists in the UK to the extent that many have now moved across the Atlantic where there is greater support for BAME artists and knowledge about marketing to diverse audiences.*

---

74 Arts Council England and the Bookseller (2004), In Full Colour: Cultural Diversity in Book Publishing Today
75 MCAAH, 2003, p. 35
Black, Asian and minority ethnic views on leadership diversity

As part of this study data was collected from 25 Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) professionals and focus groups were undertaken in London, Birmingham, Manchester and Leeds (see Appendix for details). The majority of respondents expressed the view that the creative and cultural sector is more tolerant than most and is more diverse than it was ten years ago. However, they also stressed that real equality and diversity is still a long way off and that visible high-profile black leaders are still few and far between. The leadership norm in the sector is still seen as white, male, able-bodied, middle/upper class and Oxbridge educated.

Respondents stressed that the sector needs to go through a further process of change in order to achieve real changes in leadership and that the only way to achieve long-lasting change is through commitment and leadership from the most senior individuals in organisations, including from boards of directors. This echoes the findings of Arts Council England’s Eclipse report on theatre in England in 2002, which stressed that there was a need not only for more ethnic diversity in leadership but also the need for all leaders in the sector to take cultural diversity seriously. The report noted that there needs to be a shift from ‘individual champions’ of cultural diversity in arts organisations to serious long-lasting change from the top down, which could be achieved by ‘consistent leadership from boards of directors, senior managers and the funding bodies’.

Respondents felt that promoting change and inclusivity in the sector has often been left to individual champions within creative and cultural organisations. Numerous examples were given of organisations that lose or gain momentum on diversity through the appointment or departure of just one member of staff. They stressed that to make sustainable change and progress all cultural leaders need to promote equality and diversity. As one focus group participant stated, ‘this is not a black issue but an organisational one, and it should not be left exclusively to black people to deal with’.

Many of the respondents recognised that championing diversity is often not an easy option for white leaders. However, the perception was that it could not be avoided if managers were to do a good job in promoting equality, facilitating diverse work teams and focusing on BAME community needs. In the words of an Eclipse participant, ‘many people think they are good managers but actually they do what I call a partial job. Because if you are not developing and supporting all your staff and if you don’t have the breadth of knowledge and experience that diversity brings represented in your organisation, then you are not delivering the best service you can.’

The issue of the board’s role and representation in promoting diversity also came up consistently in focus groups and interviews. There was a common view that boards are not doing enough to embrace the realities of a diverse and multicultural Britain or to consider the kind of leadership that is required in this changing social context.

---

5 the response of the creative and cultural sector

While significant challenges remain in tackling under-representation, particularly in senior positions, as well as addressing broader equality and diversity issues, many progressive organisations and individuals in the sector are taking a strong lead in responding to the case for more diverse leadership.

This section reviews some of the initiatives and successes that are diversifying the leadership and workforce of the creative and cultural sector. It offers examples of good practice, as well as an assessment of the impact that these have had on the sector. The responses fall into five broad categories:

• Diversity policies
• Workforce development policies and programmes
• Research and evaluation
• Specific initiatives
• Advocacy and support groups

Diversity policies

In some parts of the sector under-representation at all levels is more acute than in others and wider diversity initiatives have taken precedence over specific initiatives to address recruitment, retention and progression challenges in relation to Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) managers and leaders. At the centre of many responses is an overarching diversity policy and action plan. This is required by law under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 (RRAA) for public agencies. However, diversity policies are also being developed by private sector companies for legal, business and moral and ethical reasons. Diversity policies are often specific to workforce monitoring, recruitment and development, but can also include procurement and other specific initiatives.

The Department for Culture Media and Sport's diversity policy states that there is a strong business case for involving all sections of society in both its workforce and its policies, and that it cannot afford to miss the opportunities and talent offered by engaging with a truly diverse population. Its Race Equality Scheme, first published in 2002 and revised in August 2006, states that: ‘our vision is to become a Department which represents at all levels, including the most senior, the different communities it serves; which treats all staff equally; and which reaches out to all parts of society and genuinely reflects their
interests. We want to be seen as a good place to work - and a good Department with which to do business - by all ethnic groups.’

DCMS’s new Equality Scheme 2006-2009 builds upon the existing Race Equality Scheme to address new duties arising from the Disability Discrimination Act and legislation dealing with gender equality, as well addressing other equality strands (age, religion or belief and sexual orientation). Responding to fears that putting the six equality strands together may retard progress on racial equality, the Scheme stresses that reporting will ensure that progress on each equality strand is distinct and clearly identifiable.

Arts Council England’s Race Equality Scheme was launched in 2005 and followed on from its Cultural Diversity Action plan, launched in 1998. The Race Equality Scheme has been the central mechanism for making progress towards the Arts Council’s race equality goals. The scheme has promoted change both internally and within regularly funded organisations through the Respond diversity toolkit. The Arts Council is now reviewing its race equality strategy and action plan to ensure that its diversity strategy meets the needs of the 21st century.

**Workforce development policies and programmes**

The need for workforce development in the sector is clearly recognised by DCMS. Its recent strategy document Creative Britain77 details 26 commitments on how the government will take action to support the creative industries. Commitment 3 addresses diversity and states that: ‘DCMS will work with its Non Departmental Public Bodies, and through them its sectors, to agree actions to promote a more diverse workforce. Ensuring such diversity will continue to require some intervention, whether through education and training, outreach work, spreading good practice or awards which recognise the most diverse firms. We will work with the industry to identify suitable projects, and fund them where appropriate.’

Workforce development programmes are often the main component of a diversity policy and action plan. They provide broad macro-level objectives for a desirable end state for the workforce profile over a period of time, as well as the milestones and steps necessary to get there.

**Respond: diversifying the RFO workforce** was launched by Arts Council England in 2005 as a toolkit for Regularly Funded Organisations (RFOs) to enable them to develop and implement positive action plans to diversify their workforce and governance structures. The toolkit provided guidance and RFOs were able to draw on training and consultancy support from the Arts Council to draft their action plans. It is now a condition of their funding agreements that these organisations implement race equality plans. In 2007 69% of RFOs had a race equality action plan and a further 28% had plans in development. In 2007 15% of managers in organisations with action plans were BAME compared to 13% for those with plans in development and 6% for those with no plan at all.78

**Museums, Libraries and Archives Council’s Renaissance in the Regions** included a workforce development programme. This is a good example of a cross cutting approach towards addressing workforce diversity.79 One of the priority areas of Renaissance 2006-2008 is developing the workforce

---

79 MLA’s vision for the development of regional museums across England is set out in Renaissance in the Regions (2001), the report of the Regional Museums Task Force commissioned by the Department for Culture Media and Sport (DCMS). The major objective of Renaissance in the Regions was to establish a much stronger strategic and operational framework for museums and galleries throughout the country, based on a philosophy of cooperation and mutual dependency.
in hub museums, including valuing and nurturing workforce diversity. The rationale for the programme is that workforce diversity, along with equality of opportunity, is essential in enabling museums to deliver and sustain the modernising vision Investing in Knowledge. The programme has involved a workforce audit as well as embedding diversity in organisations through individually tailored diversity plans for each museum.

Research, consultation and evaluation

High-quality and focused research and evaluation is essential in determining the effectiveness of policies, identifying challenges, formulating future approaches and developing innovative projects that respond to real needs. The Arts Council and MLA both have a strong record in evaluation of their diversity schemes and projects to ensure there is continuous learning both for the organisation and the sector. There is a substantive record of research on diversity, but less so on diversity in leadership in the sector. This section highlights some of the existing research relevant to workforce diversity and leadership development. It is clear that often when an area has been identified as requiring attention, a working group or task force bringing together key individuals from the sector has been formed to address the issue.

The Cultural Diversity Working Group, chaired by Sandy Nairne, Director of the National Portrait Gallery, was set up in 2004 to advise the National Museums Directors’ Conference. The most prominent issue to emerge from the work of the Group was the lack of diversity within the workforce of the museums sector. While there is considerable diversity in areas such as visitor services and administration, the staffing in curatorial, education and senior management is more monocultural. The working groups recommended that good quality training and development schemes would not only help the sector as a whole but also provide a wider range of future candidates for more specialist and senior posts that are required within museums and galleries. The report reinforced the importance of emphasising diversity within leadership schemes of all kinds.

Today’s People: entry into the museums sector recommended that far greater efforts needed to be made to diversify the museum workforce and other research into routes into sector has found that careers in museums and galleries are unlikely to even register on the radar screen of students from BAME backgrounds when it comes to training and career choices. Several recent reports have suggested that museums have an image issue and that there is a need to improve careers advice and promote museum work to a wider range of young people.

Whose Theatre? is a significant consultation with BAME-led theatre companies which the Arts Council led as part of sustained theatre consultation and the Whose Theatre? report that evaluated the situation of Black theatre in the UK to determine infrastructure and development needs for the next 10-20 years. The Whose Theatre? report, authored by Baroness Lola Young, synthesises the findings of the consultation and makes recommendations in five key areas:

---

80 The MLA’s strategy document Learning for Change also makes the diversity objective clear: “In order to deliver this vision the sector needs to recruit, retain and develop a diverse, appropriately skilled workforce.” The strategy’s definition of workforce applies to all those work in and for the sector, including employed staff, staff on fixed-term contracts, consultants, freelancers, volunteers, governors and trustees.
81 Investing in Knowledge is MLA’s five-year vision for the sector. It highlights the importance of the wealth of knowledge contained in museums, libraries and archives in underpinning community cohesion, learning and skills, economic development and creativity. www.mla.gov.uk/policy/investing_in_knowledge
82 www.nationalmuseums.org.uk/diversity.html
83 Maurice Davies (2007), Tomorrow’s People: entry into the museums sector
84 Bridging the Perception and Reality Gap: Museums and Galleries for the 21st Century, Global Graduates (2005)
buildings for the future, cultural leadership, critical debate and archiving, international, and Arts Council England.85

The report found that ‘as there is not a sustainable infrastructure in the Sector86 for the development of its practitioners, and as opportunities for career advancement in the mainstream have not improved to a significant extent, so initiatives have developed from the Arts Council, the Independent Theatre Council, the Theatrical Management Association, the BBC and other organisations and institutions.’87

One of the main findings of the consultation was that professional development in The Sector should be promoted as an essential process rather than as ‘remedial work with continually emerging practitioners’.88 The report states that opportunities for leaders at all levels (emerging, mid-career and established) should be available in all aspects of theatre practice, and that particular attention should be paid to artists’ creative professional development. On organisational and individual leadership and governance the report notes that ‘the responses relating to leadership suggested a sector that has had its confidence bruised. Few people were prepared to say “I am a leader in the field” or that their organisation had a leadership role to play in the Sector.’89

Evaluation has become recognised as a vital and central component of many diversity projects. The evaluations of the Diversify, Inspire initiatives (see page 69) and the publishing internship programme all offer useful lessons and learning for the sector in relation to the effectiveness of particular types of diversity interventions. However, it should be noted that respondents suggested that much more needed to be done to disseminate project learning across the sector and more widely.

Specific initiatives

Specific initiatives and projects have also been effective in making progress in promoting race equality and cultural diversity in the creative and cultural sectors. For example, Arts Council England has supported a number of high-profile diversity initiatives ranging from British Regional Initiative in Theatre (BRIT), through to its recent decibel programme, which ran from 2004 to 2008 and is now in its legacy phase.

decibel is Arts Council England’s £10 million programme that ran from 2004 to 2008 and provided showcase opportunities and development for Black and Asian artists and organisations in performing and visual arts, literature and music. Now in its legacy phase, there will be at least two more decibel showcases in 2009 and 2011.90 Other diversity initiatives have been developed and implemented by regional offices including the Inspire programme, led by the London office, which offers fellowship awards to curators; and Maximise, the audience development project in Yorkshire.

The impact of the programme across the sectors and industries has been wide and varied. Good progress has been made in the publishing industry where the work has focused on initiating change from within. Across the spectrum of performing arts increased exposure and recognition for artists and companies has created opportunities for them to have their work seen by new audiences. Visual

---

85 Lola Young (2006), Whose Theatre…? Report on the Sustained Theatre consultation. Following the Whose Theatre? report four delivery groups were set up to develop action plans to respond to the recommendations in the report. The delivery groups were subsequently consolidated into the Artist Action Group who will oversee the process of action plan delivery.
86 In the report The Sector refers to Black-led theatre.
87 Young, 2006, p. 20
88 Ibid, p. 7
89 Ibid, p. 43
90 The decibel Showcase will continue and will be held in Birmingham in 2009
artists and curators have been provided with support and developmental guidance that has broadened their perspectives on their creative practices and created an environment of greater understanding between individuals and institutions. Specifically, regional decibel activity significantly and favourably increased engagement, activity and relationships between artists and companies from the decibel remit and regional officers.

The GAIN board development programme\(^{91}\) was established to address the under-representation of BAME individuals on boards in the creative and cultural sector. It recognised the need to diversify boards and equip leaders with the right skills to make the most of these opportunities as well as expanding their spheres of influence.

Whilst some of these initiatives and projects have been effective in meeting their short-term objectives, they have been criticised by some in the field for being limited in their sustainable impact and change.

**Advocacy and support groups**

In response to the need for greater diversity in the sector a number of advocacy and support groups have been set up to either drive change or to support diverse individuals and groups in the sector who may otherwise be isolated.

The Arts Council’s Black Workers’ Group has recognised the need to support BAME workers on a day-to-day basis through the development and support of the Black Workers’ Group. The Group has an open agenda and provides a voice for BAME staff in the organisation as well as a consultation mechanism for senior management.

CILIP Diversity Group aims to bring together those members of CILIP (the Chartered Institute of Library and Information Professionals) who are engaged in, or interested in, issues of diversity as they affect the library and information community.\(^{92}\) It also seeks to foster communication between such members, facilitate the exchange of experience, and enhance work relevant to supporting and promoting library and information services to diverse and excluded communities.

DCMS Diversity Network provides a discussion and action forum on equal opportunities and diversity issues. The network has developed five challenges for the DCMS board, including a Leadership Challenge that requires board members to develop personal statements of commitment towards promoting diversity, with a progress assessment built into board appraisal arrangements.

Alliance for Diversity in Music and Media was set up in 2008 by a select group of music industry executives in response to the Creative & Cultural Skills Footprint and personal experiences within the industry. The Alliance brings together disparate schemes sharing a common goal: ensuring fair representation and progression of minorities within the music and related media sectors.\(^{93}\) It aims to increase the percentage of BAME individuals employed in executive positions in the music and media industries and to increase access and opportunity in general for members of the BAME communities towards a proportion equivalent to the BAME make-up of the UK economy as a whole.

---

\(^{91}\) GAIN is a board development programme aimed at individuals from Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) groups managed by the Independent Theatre Council on behalf of Arts Council England, Sporting Equals, the Greater London Authority and Arts & Business. The programme offered modular training covering aspects of governance and diversity from which participating potential trustees, chairs, board members and senior management team members of organisations can choose. www.gain.itc-arts.org

\(^{92}\) www.cilip.org.uk/specialinterestgroups/bysubject/diversity

\(^{93}\) www.alliancefordiversity.org.uk/
Creative industries and private sector response

While it is not subject to the same legislative duties as the public sector, the private sector has increasingly begun to act on the diversity imperative and diversity policies and practices have become more widespread, particularly at the level of large and international companies. Many large businesses have set diversity objectives and many employ diversity, equality or inclusion managers to drive forward the goals of embedding equality and diversity into their corporate cultures.

A number of key drivers are enabling this process. Globalisation, with the opportunities it provides to capture larger market shares and customers bases, is the most significant. With their international scope, high-profile diversity campaigns, and the diversification of their product ranges to meet the needs of targeted communities, banks are a good example of the way private sector companies are responding to both international markets and increasing diversity.

Many companies have started to look at their suppliers’ diversity and to insist on acceptable diversity policies and standards from their suppliers. This not only helps drive internal culture change but also has an impact on the wider corporate world, with large private firms looking at the workforce profile and ethos of the companies they do business with. In March 2007 Microsoft UK led by example when it stopped using one of its providers due to its poor policy on the issue. According to Brian Ford, director of marketing at the Chartered Institute of Purchasing and Supply (CIPS), ‘it is a growing trend for suppliers to be asked for their diversity policies. We have seen this grow over the past few months and we can’t see that changing. It would be sensible for employers to put policies in place so they can’t be caught out.’

Another driver for equality and diversity within the private sector is the corporate social responsibility (CSR) and ethical business agenda that has been adopted by many large businesses.

Shell is a good example of an international company serving diverse customers and attempting to develop a substantive CSR agenda in response to some of the criticism it has received from Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) in relation to the impact of the company’s business on the environment and on some communities.

According to Shell’s sustainability report in 2007 the percentage of countries with the majority of local nationals in senior level positions is 33. The report also maps the percentage of senior leadership staff by nationality, noting that 31.7% are from the UK, 29.3% from the USA and Canada and 1.6% from the Caribbean, Central and South America. It has a number of useful indicators in place. For example, a national indicator measure requires that local people fill more than half the senior management positions in every country the company operates in. It also has a diversity and inclusion indicator that attempts to measure staff perceptions of inclusion in their workplace, measured by the Shell People Survey. In the 2006 Survey 64% of employees were positive about inclusion in their part of Shell. Much work was done in 2007 to address areas for improvement such as a review of flexible working options and childcare provisions, as well as the expansion of existing training programmes to promote inclusion.
The company is engaged with sustainability programmes and now supports a number of human rights initiatives. Shell runs an Executive Leadership Programme (ELP) and a Group Business Leadership Programme (GBLP) that attempt to strengthen leadership competencies such as delivery, motivation and expanding business opportunities. The main objective of the ELP is to raise awareness of leadership dilemmas facing top managers in general and Shell managers in particular. The GBLP is a highly tailored leadership programme that addresses the need to strengthen the leadership competencies such as delivering results (accountability for longer term execution), motivating/coaching/developing (focusing on people not just decisions), building shared vision (mobilising energy and commitment), and maximising business opportunities (creating value through innovation). The programmes also attempt to deal with issues of diversity in the light of Shell’s status as a transnational corporation with an extremely diverse workforce.

Sony is another example directly relevant for the sector. Its policy states that ‘Sony is committed to respecting human rights and providing equal opportunities. To this end, Sony is focusing on promoting diversity among its personnel as a significant component of CSR and believes firmly in the importance of understanding and reflecting diverse views in its business operations.’

EMI has been collecting data on employee diversity across its worldwide operations for the past five years, and it restricts its definition of management to senior executives only, in order to have a robust baseline for measuring progress.

Case Study: Institute of Practitioners in Advertising

Professional bodies play an important role in many of the self-regulated industries such as advertising. In 2003 the Institute of Practitioners in Advertising (IPA) set up an Ethnic Diversity Group responding to the fact that the industry has done little to promote greater understanding and employment of ethnic minorities across the board despite their cultural and economic contribution. It also created an online guide to ethnic diversity in the UK as part of a self-declared ethnic diversity week for the advertising industry. The guide was the culmination of a two-year project by the IPA Ethnic Diversity Group and looked at the portrayal and employment of ethnic minorities in advertising. This included the publication of two reports on cultural diversity in the sector; Ethnic Diversity Research Report (2002) and Ethnic Representation in Agencies (2005). The IPA has also previously run a programme that focused on the representation of women in the industry.

Following the departure of the Chair, the MD of an agency with a personal interest in the issue and widely respected in the industry, the recent activity of the Group appears to have been more limited. This points to the continued importance of individuals in driving diversity initiatives and raises issues about sustainability.
Research into reasons for under-representation in the advertising industry among BAME people often highlights parental pressure to work in other industries or professions, as well as parental perceptions that it is ‘not a proper career’. In a broader effort to diversify its workforce, the advertising company Ogilvy and Mather targeted ‘second jobbers’ who may be working in professional roles in the city. The IPA is also developing CPD for the industry to professionalise career development to make it more attractive to a wider range of individuals.

Diversity is also regarded as an important issue by other leading publishing houses such as Penguin and Random House, which continue to offer positive action traineeships. Pearson, who own Penguin, are one of the few companies from the creative industries registered with the Race for Opportunity Benchmarking programme. In addition to a range of diversity initiatives, Pearson has a diversity at Pearson website specifically to outline its vision on diversity and promote opportunities such as its positive action internships.

Case Study: Publishing Training Programmes

Responses from the private sector are sometimes a result of public/private partnership working. Publishing is a good example. While there are a number of high-profile Black and Asian writers, representation in leadership and senior management positions in the industry is low. In order to address this issue, Arts Council England through the decibel literature programme developed a positive action traineeship in partnership with the industry. All those involved in the traineeships are now in permanent positions in the publishing industry, with the majority working in different organisations to those where they did their traineeships. Partnership working, the role of the programme co-coordinator, and the continual evaluation process are identified as the main success factors for this initiative.

102 The Pearson internship launched in 2001 was the UK’s first publishing diversity training scheme. The programme accepts 20 to 25 candidates for six weeks each summer, providing interns with experience in Penguin, Pearson Education or Edexcel Learning. http://extranet2.pearson.com/diversity/
103 Following consultation with Penguin UK who had been running an internship for ethnic minority students in 2004, and as part of the decibel programme, the Arts Council worked with major publishing houses to deliver a three-year BAME traineeship programme, which was run in collaboration with large publishing houses including Faber & Faber and Random House. Th Arts Council split the costs of the traineeships fifty-fifty with the publishers.

56
6 challenges for Black, Asian and minority ethnic leaders

‘It’s not just about the numbers’, said one of the interviewees for this study when asked about the representations of Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) leaders in the sector. He described the experience of many BAME leaders when he went on to say, ‘Who wants to be a black leader? You spend your career working hard to get to that position and then when you get there people will try to take you down, find the one thing you’ve done wrong and prove that the stereotype they have in their head is right.’

This section sets out the issues and experiences shared by participants during the consultation, interview and focus group (see Appendix for details). Respondents were selected to ensure a wide representation in terms of ethnicity and geography.

The quality of experiences of BAME leaders is critical in determining whether or not they choose to remain within mainstream creative and cultural organisations. The difficult experiences of many BAME senior managers were raised as concerns by a large number of leaders in the field during this research and many believed that some of their minority ethnic colleagues had left their posts due to job and status dissatisfaction.

Most participants stated that they had got to leadership positions through unconventional means. For some the break had come as a result of specific directors or senior managers seeing their potential and giving them an opportunity to take on managerial duties and roles. Being given the chance, and being pushed and supported by individual managers, was the key to their success. However, these individuals stressed that they saw themselves as fortunate as such interested managers were not the norm.

The majority of focus group participants had moved into the sector as a second or even third career, coming from fields as diverse as marketing, teaching, probation, social work, athletics, and health. Some said they had made a number of sideways moves into jobs that were easy to master and which left them enough free time to pursue their own research interests and professional development activities to enable them to move on and up.
The experiences of leaders varied considerably depending on where and how they are employed. We have divided them into two broad groupings: those working in senior management positions in large public sector organisations, and those running their own small to medium size enterprises or self-employed.

Leadership in large statutory organisations

BAME leaders in large creative and cultural organisations, as well as those working in cultural departments of local authorities, overwhelmingly reported negative experiences. Common perceptions included:

- Low employment mobility, the persistence of old boys networks and perceptions of a very low ethnicity ceiling. This led many to feel suffocated through the lack of opportunity and they lost morale, motivation and aspirations. Many highlighted the problem of BAME professionals in the sector having the necessary skills and attributes but not the opportunity or situations in which to lead.

- There is a strong belief that white managers are not interested in developing, encouraging, or nurturing the talent of BAME staff. Respondents believed that they are seen as vulnerable and their strengths are not recognised or supported. There was also a frustration that BAME leaders are always seen as emerging; never established.

- Some respondents noted that there is still a widespread lack of acceptance of BAME people in management positions by white staff and spoke of the challenges of giving direction to (monocultural) organisations that are not receptive to BAME leaders.

- Many interviewees spoke about the isolation of black staff and leaders, many of whom may find themselves ‘being the majority of one’ in their organisation, department or board. Some said they feel like pioneers, but that they do not get the support they need from their immediate group and need to go outside for this. This is seen as particularly difficult for individuals in the regions where there may be limited external support networks.

- Linked to the issue of isolation is that of invisibility. Respondents spoke of people not ‘seeing you’ yet at the same time of feeling more visible and watched. This is not an unusual sentiment and can reflect the variety of ways in which individuals are made to feel uneasy in unwelcoming environments. Some felt that sometimes standing out from the crowd can work to an individual’s advantage. However, this usually requires great skill in navigating ‘being part of’ yet ‘different’ in an organisation.

- There were also some sector specific challenges. Many raised the issue of working in a cultural environment dominated by the primacy of ‘Western art’ as a problem. Respondents suggested that they often face a culture or values clash on what is good, excellent or important and this can cause conflicts with staff and colleagues. The lack of understanding in the mainstream about non-Western artistic and cultural expressions can often result in the skills and specialism of BAME leaders not being recognised and limit their chances of further progression.
• BAME leaders, particularly males, felt that their attempts to raise issues in day-to-day situations of organisational conflict are often labelled as aggressive. In addition, some felt that the same symptoms or behaviours if displayed by a white middle class woman would be viewed and treated differently. These stereotypes are not peculiar to the sector and reflect the wider issue of styles and labelling in different contexts: one person’s aggressiveness may be another’s (desirable) assertiveness. The central issue can often be not the behaviour itself but who has the power to label the behaviour.

• Respondents also highlighted a perceived tendency amongst institutions in the sector to appoint BAME leaders in order to improve their staffing profiles. But then, wittingly or unwittingly, set them up to fail by placing them into projects that they are not suited to. This can be either by not giving them enough authority or by giving them responsibility but not the power, resources or managerial sanctions to carry them out. Respondents felt that often the only resources BAME leaders are left with are those of influence, persuasion and argument. Inevitably most do not produce their best work in such contexts and this results in the work and their reputation becoming devalued overall.

Leadership in small to medium enterprises and self-employment

BAME leaders working outside the formal institutional structure of the sector appeared more content. The key factor contributing to this was the feeling of setting up, being in control of, and managing, their own activities. However, in this context they face their own, very different, constraints and problems. A small number of respondents indicated that they have been forced into self-employment because of the lack of opportunities, or due to their failure to break through into the mainstream. The problem areas raised by respondents tended to focus on operational difficulties and include:

• Availability of venues and exhibition spaces.
• Provision when out of office and difficulties of finding cover.
• Loneliness of working independently unless involved in a high level of networking, which itself can impact on personal creativity and divert from artistic achievement.
• Constraints of being non-salaried and the impact this can have on the uptake of training, networking, unpaid mentoring etc.
• Constraints on the materials they can produce. Some said they cannot write about certain subjects, racism for example, if they want institutional support.
• Becoming ‘funding junkies’ through the constant pressure to raise funds for their survival.
• Working independently and outside the mainstream resulting in a lack of recognition of their people skills and leadership qualities.
Wider issues for the sector

While there is a reluctance to openly use the term racism, comments from interviews and focus groups suggest that not being white is still a big disadvantage in the industry. The majority of respondents suggested that they have to work harder than their white counterparts in order to be successful. Institutional racism and class discrimination are perceived to be still widespread and are believed to be the key factor leading to the under-representation of BAME individuals at leadership levels in the sector. However, most were confident that they could personally navigate a way though these structural issues despite racism, and cited personal fear as their perceived biggest barrier to success.

Many leaders feel they have been driven out of institutions through a lack of support, withdrawal of resources, lack of career progression and by continually being given community-facing and diversity-related positions. The practices relating to unpaid work experience and a wider structural issue of low pay for some parts of the sector in particular were seen as a key issue, and particularly significant for BAME people who may not have the parental or wider resources to subsidise the gaining of experience.

BAME leaders mentioned advocacy frequently. Many consciously focus on issues for socially excluded groups and see themselves as rooted in community activism, social enterprise and social engagement in their communities. In addition, many stress the importance of not losing contact at grassroots level and some expressed fears about leaving their community and personal identity behind. However, advocacy often brings with it ‘the burden of representation’ and the pressures of stereotyping and being expected to be representative of their communities. In the interests of creating diverse profiles, various boards, panels and committees tend to co-opt experienced BAME people. Often this can become hugely time consuming and take them away from creative or development work, and in some cases may restrict access to funds for their organisations through a potential conflict of interests.

While networking was recognised as an important route into leadership positions, participants raised the issue that BAME leaders are not well plugged into powerful sector networks. These were seen as dominated by Oxbridge and ‘those in the know’. Respondents find it difficult to build and maintain cross-race and cross-class networks. A suggestion was made for cultural brokers who can help people network outside their immediate set of contacts and sphere of work.

While participants had very mixed views about the extent to which BAME leaders need to subordinate their cultural identity in order to succeed in mainstream organisations, most agreed that language and accent are important in determining how far people progress in leadership positions. Recognising it and utilising the acceptable vocabulary of organisations was seen as vital in success.

Participants suggested that, given the changing nature of the BAME British experience, individuals need to shift from thinking about resistance and survival strategies to thinking about models of success. To be successful leaders individuals need to have a great deal of
confidence in themselves and others as well as the personal self-belief to say ‘I am a leader’. As such, leaders and potential leaders need to push their own boundaries. They have to be visionaries and must aspire to be someone, to go for more senior jobs, to want to be a chief executive. Respondents noted that parental influence and role models who are supportive of early ambitions and can guide or provide opportunities are extremely important.
7 training and professional development opportunities and issues

Workforce development policies generally go hand in hand with enhanced training and development opportunities. Respondents in this study stressed that professional development opportunities, particularly those providing leadership and management skills, are important for career development and progression specifically in relation to the skills gained, the contacts made and networks accessed.

High quality training and development provision is particularly vital in the creative and cultural sector where there are fewer opportunities available than in other sectors. In 2005/06 66% of creative and cultural organisations did not arrange for any training. In contrast, across the UK employers and practitioners spent on average 15 days training per year. The vast majority of companies are small, which means that individuals are thrust into positions of responsibility very quickly and often find themselves navigating without a useful set of management and leadership tools. For many there are no professional routes into these positions supported by consistent accreditation or training opportunities. Given the distinctive nature of the work, creative and cultural sector jobs can also require a distinct set of leadership and management skills, particularly in positions of cultural leadership.

It should be noted however that creative and cultural organisations are now recognising the value of professional development as a core support need if high quality leadership in the sector is to be developed, as well as for addressing issues of workforce diversity and Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) leadership development.

106 Creative & Cultural Skills (2008), Creative Blueprint – England, p. 28
107 Ibid.
108 Graham Devlin, Hilary Carty and Nicola Turner (2008), Meeting the Challenge
Professional development programmes

The provision of industry-specific leadership and management courses, though starting from a low base, has increased in recent years particularly through the Clore Leadership Programme and the Cultural Leadership Programme. The museums sector was the first to highlight the issue and provide sector specific leadership training. In 1997 the Holland Report by the Museums Training Institute concluded that well-developed strategic management skills and leadership abilities were vital for the museum sector.\textsuperscript{109} This was followed in 2001 by the Renaissance in the Regions report that highlighted a leadership vacuum in regional museums due to a lack of training and developmental support.

In the arts sector a report published in 2000 by Metier, the former national training organisation for the performing arts sector, The Leadership Challenge warned that ‘the sector under-invests in management and leadership at most levels’.\textsuperscript{110} The report stated that “The Arts Council of England fears that many of the future leaders will have left the industry around their early forties, as they find that family and other commitments necessitate better paid employment’.\textsuperscript{111}

Leadership training in the sector was also identified as a key area in need of investment by the trustees of the Clore Duffield Foundation who set up a task force to look at how it could make a significant contribution to the leadership training of creative and cultural leaders in the UK.

The Clore Leadership Programme was launched in 2003 following the recommendations of the task force report published in 2002.\textsuperscript{112} It currently offers bespoke training (the Fellowship Programme) to a small cohort of leaders in the cultural sector.\textsuperscript{113} The programme’s success has been based on partnerships with institutions and other training and leadership programmes. There is also now a two-week intensive short course based on the residential element of the Fellowship Programme.

The growing recognition of the need for the provision of specific leadership training has led to a number of accredited courses:

City University’s Cultural Policy and Management Department at launched the first academically accredited course in Cultural Leadership in 2006.

Liverpool University launched a Masters in Cultural Leadership in 2008, providing a regional dimension that had been lacking.

The government demonstrated its commitment to enhancing and developing leadership in the sector by funding the Cultural Leadership Programme, which was launched in 2006 with £12 million support from the Treasury.\textsuperscript{114} At the programme’s launch, Gordon Brown, then Chancellor of the Exchequer, made a point of prioritising diversity in the sector: ‘If this significant part of our economy is to prosper and grow, we must recognise the role of our cultural leaders in delivering that success and ensure the emergence of a talented and diverse group of future leaders.’\textsuperscript{115}

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{109} Sir Geoffrey Holland (1991), Report, p. 41
\item \textsuperscript{110} The Leadership Challenge: a review of management and leadership in subsidised arts organisations in England, Metier, 2000, p. 5
\item \textsuperscript{111} Metier, 2000, p. 35
\item \textsuperscript{112} Clore Duffield Foundation, An Investment in the Rising Generation of Cultural Leaders is Necessary, and Timely, December 2002
\item \textsuperscript{113} http://www.cloreleadership.org
\item \textsuperscript{114} The programme’s primary focus is on the core cultural sector which consists of crafts; libraries & archives; museums & galleries; music; performing; literary & visual arts. However, given the importance of the creative industries to economic development as well as other cultural industries including heritage, the programme does not limit itself exclusively to this primary core. www.culturalleadership.org.uk
\item \textsuperscript{115} http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/pressnews/press_detail.php?id=10&pid=665
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
The Cultural Leadership Programme focuses on work-based opportunities, an online resource for learning, intensive leadership development, the Powerbrokers strand for diversity, best practice for governing bodies, and entrepreneurs as leaders. An important aim of the Cultural Leadership Programme is to enhance the diversity of current and future leaders, with a particular focus on BAME leaders. Key starting points for the sector and the Cultural Leadership Programme in achieving cultural diversity include developing an understanding of what constitutes cultural leadership; how diversity in cultural sector leadership is being developed and nurtured; and what the BAME contribution to the cultural sector is.

Powerbrokers has broken new ground in terms of considering the issue of BAME leadership within the cultural sector. Precisely because of its novel nature the strand has not had a great deal of evidence on which to base interventions. In response it has commissioned new research and sought out the views of key industry figures. It has also sought to embed knowledge by linking up different activities and different strands.

Activities such as the Critical Debates have been very well attended and the use of high profile speakers has helped to keep the issue of BAME cultural leadership in the spotlight beyond the initial flurry of activity.

- Strategic management skills training: five day-long sessions covering three topic areas: media skills, finance and governance;
- Action learning sets: a combination of national development days and follow up group sessions for 25 participants;
- Executive leadership development sessions: two workshops and three breakfasts/lunches targeted at senior BAME leaders.

- Powerbrokers international leadership placements: three-month leadership placements are arranged with host organisations in North America, the Caribbean and South East Asia including libraries, museums, galleries, arts centres, theatre and dance organisations. The placements provide the opportunity for mid-career leaders to extend their leadership learning through delivering discrete projects in culturally diverse organisations internationally.
- Powerbrokers Advance: three top-level and distinguished leadership schemes: Aarohan-Ahead, The Hot House and PowerLabs. Powerbrokers Advance offers talented individuals who demonstrate outstanding potential to excel and to promote models of excellence in leadership the opportunity to create tailored learning and benefit from significant professional and personal development progression including strategic career guidance, targeted sector advice, mentoring and coaching platforms.

The Cultural Leadership Programme is using this eclectic mix of opportunities to develop a range of leadership development experiences and opportunities to strengthen and expand diversity across the sectors.

Some of the other programmes in the sector have also made diversity a key focus or ensured that there are fewer barriers to accessing courses. The Clore Leadership Programme is seeking to ensure that gender and racial equality are reflected in access to its programmes. Since its inception 17.5% of Clore Fellows and 8% of its 213 short course participants have been from BAME backgrounds.

As part of its wider diversity strategy, the Museums, Libraries and Archives Council (MLA) also supports a range of leadership programmes including those offered by the Cultural Leadership Programme. International travel bursaries are also available through the Future Leaders scheme that is managed in partnership with the British Council.

**Leading Archives and Museums** is a leadership development programme for future leaders and senior managers developed by FPM Training in partnership with MLA specifically with the sector in mind. The programme was piloted in 2005/06 and responds to the demands for more effective leadership in museums, libraries and archives. FPM also runs Leading Modern Public Libraries, a leadership development course for the Libraries and Information System (LIS) sector.

FPM conducted two BAME specific focus groups to identify any specific considerations for the development and design of the programme. One of the key findings was that potential BAME leaders did not want a separate training strand based on ethnicity and therefore provision was made through the main programme. There was BAME representation on the courses, including a number of Diversify participants but it is impossible to know whether the participant
profile was representative of the sector given the limited data available. It is hoped the work of the MLA to benchmark its museums workforce will ensure that future programmes are able to monitor representation against the sector profile.

Leadership and professional development programmes are also developed and delivered by arts and cultural organisation themselves. For example, Tamasha theatre offers a residency programme that provides the opportunity for artists to develop their professional skills relating to marketing, fundraising and project management. The directors of the organisation are keen that the wealth of knowledge that they have gained through developing Tamasha into a successful Regularly Funded Organisation is passed on to ensure a sustainable legacy for Asian theatre in the UK. They also run a Developing Artists programme that offers workshops, intensive training, master classes and traineeships, as well as ongoing professional support.

Positive action training

Initiatives by sector agencies in the form of positive action training programmes aim to enhance entry into the professions and the continued professional development of BAME staff at senior levels.

The Diversify programme began in 2002 and is funded by MLA. It has successfully enabled people from BAME communities to develop skills and experience to work in museums through positive action traineeships. 77 people had been trained as part of the scheme by April 2007. Out of these 32 have gained jobs in the sector, 37 are in training, and four are undertaking PhDs. Of the 5% of BAME students on postgraduate museum courses in England 4% are Diversify funded.

The Diversify programme is piloting a management traineeship to address the lack of BAME leaders in the museums sector. The scheme challenges the established and embedded routes to senior positions by removing barriers such as having to have a PhD or Masters qualification and experience as a curator.

The Diversify programme is now piloting a management traineeship. The pilot scheme involves two trainees both of who are from outside of the sector but in managerial roles in other public services. The scheme challenges the established routes into senior positions by removing barriers such as having a masters or doctoral qualification and experience as a curator. As one interviewee said, ‘being a curator does not guarantee that you will be a good leader or manager. The sector needs these skills and the barriers currently restrict the types of people in these positions and the skill-sets that they bring to the job.’

Although an evaluation of the Diversify programme provided some evidence that the programme had generated some organisational change, the benefits were seen to predominantly accrue to the individual. However, in a sector with significant barriers to entry, ensuring entry points for under-represented groups remains vital. The programme would benefit from being part of a wider workforce development programme to enhance sustainable organisational change.

The Inspire Fellowship Programme, launched in 2005, is a positive action traineeship that aims to
diversify the profile of the curatorial workforce in museums and galleries in London and to create a more culturally inclusive curatorial workforce. The programme has worked with, and placed curators in, the British Museum, National Portrait Gallery, National Gallery, Tate Modern, the V&A, Barbican Art Gallery, British Council, the Hayward Gallery at the Southbank Centre, the Institute of Contemporary Arts, the Serpentine Gallery and the Whitechapel art gallery.

The Chartered Institute of Library and Information Professionals (CILIP) has taken a lead in proposing a traineeship programme based on the Diversify format for the library sector. As part of its Equal Opportunities statement, agreed by Council in 2003, CILIP has an objective ‘to work towards establishing an Learning and Information System (LIS) workforce that is representative of the diversity within UK society’.

**Encompass**, as it is provisionally titled, aims to get over 100 traineeships established over 5 years with a first year pilot in London in 2008/09. The positive action trainee scheme forms part of an overall strategy developed by the Equal Opportunities and Diversity Panel to address BAME under-representation in the workforce. This also includes a proposal to adapt the Diversify toolkit developed by the Museums Association (focused on providing guidance to employers wanting to introduce a positive action scheme) for use within the LIS sector, and the development of workplace-based developmental programme for BAME staff seeking to gain an ACLIP qualification.

The archive workforce is one of the least diverse in the creative and cultural sector. Diversity initiatives focus on getting individuals into the sector, rather than any targeted development for existing BAME staff.

**Untold Riches** is a collaboration with two Sector Skills Councils and other professional agencies such as the Society of Archivists. MLA is funding structured work placements to encourage young people, particularly from BAME backgrounds, to consider careers in museums, libraries and archives. There are nine pilot work placements taking place in 2007.

**Connecting Histories** in the West Midlands includes two positive action training placements for black graduates to train and qualify as archivists. These are modelled on Diversify and are run by an ex-Diversify participant. It is hoped that this will act as a pilot to stimulate policy makers in national and regional agencies and other archive services to consider similar initiatives.

Until recently there have been limited alternative entry routes into the sector.

**The Creative Apprenticeship framework** has been developed by with funding from MLA and in this financial year MLA is funding 13 apprenticeships in museums, with some other museums also funding their own. MLA is funding Lifelong Learning UK to update the apprenticeship framework for libraries and archives.

---

121 As jobs and training courses often ask for work-based experience from applicants, Connecting Histories also provides taster sessions and volunteer opportunities for individuals to get a feel for what working in the archives and wider heritage sector entails and to enable people who are interested to get some relevant skills and experience.

122 [www.connectinghistories.org.uk/guidance/how_to_work_in_heritage.asp](http://www.connectinghistories.org.uk/guidance/how_to_work_in_heritage.asp)
Respondents’ views on leadership development programmes

Ongoing professional development was felt to be important for all leaders, and respondents named a broad range of development programmes that they had participated in, including: the Clore Leadership Programme, the Cultural Leadership Programme’s Discovering Voices and Step Change, and the Windsor Fellowship programme. The input from existing and inspiring leaders on such training programmes was seen as particularly useful. Arts Council England support in the form of fellowships, bursaries, and training budgets was highly valued by respondents.

Formal and informal mentors, coaches and network members were also identified as critical to respondent’s professional and leadership development. In identifying appropriate support the ethnic and gender background of mentors and coaches were seen as important but most respondents felt that coaches and mentors do not necessarily need to be from the same background.

Most participants were aware of, or had participated in, some form of leadership development training, most notably through the Cultural Leadership Programme and the Clore Fellowship and short course programmes. The key benefits of the programmes highlighted by respondents included:

- The development of partnerships and networks.
- The core skills training, mentoring and scope for secondment to different organisations.
- The impact of the programmes on stimulating thinking, debate and dialogue on leadership in the sector.

- The prestige of Clore, and increasingly the Cultural Leadership Programme, in opening doors and access to leadership opportunities.
- Their impact on the opportunities available in the formal education sector e.g. the development of Masters programmes in Cultural Leadership by a number of universities.
- The variety of artforms, ethnic and geographical diversity of Clore Fellows and CLP participants.

While generally welcoming the Cultural Leadership Programme and Clore, participants also raised some concerns about the current provision. These included:

- Mainstream development programmes appear to be founded upon specific models of leadership management that reflect what is already in place rather than developing genuinely different new models and thinking relevant to leadership in the context of diversity.
- The curriculum was not seen to be responding as much as it might to some of the social responsibility and community development concerns that were of interest to BAME leaders.
- Respondents felt that the Cultural Leadership Programme would be strengthened by a focus on wider change within the sector as well as a focus on individual practice and career paths. Participants felt that it could offer a more substantive and direct challenge to racism and that a focus on nurturing and developing the skills of individuals needed to work alongside institutional change programmes.
• Respondents in the regions felt that the programmes are too London focused with few accessible development opportunities in the regions. Levels of awareness about the programme and its activities are also thought to be limited in the regions.

• Participants felt that there needed to be more transparency in monitoring of those Clore Programme applicants those who do not get on the programme.

• In sub-sectors such as advertising there appears to be less awareness of specific creative leadership training provision. The great proportion of training appears to come from industry bodies such as the IPA and other organisations such as NABS.123

Formal education provision

Education provision is a vital component in increasing workforce diversity and enhancing the diversity of sector leadership for the future. Educational provision and access are also key concerns of many BAME leaders in the sector who are conscious of the development and progression needs of future BAME creative and cultural leaders. This is due to a recognition that young people from their communities need to be able to access relevant educational opportunities if they are to be able to sustain the legacy that these leaders have worked to establish.

Respondents stressed the need for a solid educational track record to enter and progress in the industries. The creative and cultural sector is perceived as a field where formal over qualification is the norm. These relatively high-level qualification requirements are seen by many as a primary barrier to entry and in many cases as unnecessary. For example, some respondents felt that museums have become accustomed to appointing over-qualified people; and the oversupply of well qualified entrants works against pressures to diversify the workforce. Jobs that could be performed by non-graduates were seen as often being carried out by people with postgraduate qualifications simply because there are so many wanting to work in museums.

In an effort to benchmark the existing uptake of higher education in cultural and creative related courses this study undertook a review of higher education provision and of the numbers of BAME students entering graduate and higher level courses. The Higher Education Funding Council for England (HEFCE) provides annual statistics on students on undergraduate, postgraduate and HND course in creative arts and design courses. Figures available for 2006/07 show that 12.7% of students accepted onto all courses were from BAME backgrounds. This is nearly 4% lower than the figure for BAME students on all degree courses in the UK, which is 16.4% (see Table 17 opposite).

Foundation creative arts and design degrees are popular amongst BAME students:

When looking at known ethnicity for UK domiciled students, 86% of first years were found to be white, 5% Black, 7% Asian and 3% from other ethnic groups. When compared to students at all levels of study these figures are quite comparable (white 86%, Black 4%, Asian 8%, other 2%). This indicates that foundation degrees are as equally attractive as other levels of higher education to students from BAME backgrounds.124

123 www.nabs.org.uk
124 HESA, 2002/03 Foundation Degrees Data Releases by HESA www.hesa.ac.uk/index.php/content/view/1067/161/
The Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA) Destinations of Leavers from Higher Education (DLHE) Longitudinal Survey provides an insight into the employment patterns of leavers three and a half years into their careers. The data is based on Longitudinal Survey responses from 24,825 graduates from the 2002/03 graduating cohort and shows that there are marked differences in employment activities between different ethnic groups. The study found that Asian and white graduates were more likely than Black graduates to be in full-time work. 75% of Asian and 74% of white graduates were identified as being in full-time work compared with 67% of Black graduates. Despite the disparity between Asian and white and Black full-time working graduates Black graduates were marginally more likely to be studying (16%) than white (14%) or Asian (13%) graduates. Black graduates were also more likely to be assumed unemployed (5%) than white (2%) or Asian (4%) graduates.

The survey also found that 22% of UK domiciled HE leavers with first degrees in creative arts and design went into the education sector followed closely by real estate, renting and business activities (18%) and other community, social and personal service activities (17%). There is no readily available information on the destinations of BAME graduates from creative arts and design degrees by subject area.

As the data available (including the HEFCE data) could not be disaggregated further, a small survey of cultural education providers in the UK was undertaken. From this sample 18% of a total of 1,340 students enrolled in the past academic year were from BAME backgrounds, excluding international students. For university courses this decreased to 9% and for postgraduate courses to 6%. The Tomorrow’s People report in 2007 on entry into the museum industry found a similar percentage (6%) among museum-only postgraduate courses.

While the sample offers a limited evidence base, one-to-one interviews with providers highlighted some of the key challenges as well as some of the progress being made in the education sector:

Under-representation and barriers to access
The experiences and views of course administrators varied about whether or not

---

Table 17: Ethnicity of student applicants and acceptances in higher education courses in creative arts and design in England, 2006

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>All applicants</th>
<th>All accepts</th>
<th>Degree accepts</th>
<th>HND accepts</th>
<th>Total students on all degree courses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>3.9%</td>
<td>8.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>3.9%</td>
<td>3.9%</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>5.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mixed</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
<td>3.6%</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>86.9%</td>
<td>87.3%</td>
<td>87.3%</td>
<td>87.3%</td>
<td>83.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number</td>
<td>43,746</td>
<td>33,461</td>
<td>31,965</td>
<td>1,496</td>
<td>809,165</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

125 HESA, Destinations of Leavers from higher education institutions longitudinal survey of the 2002/03 cohort
126 www.hesa.ac.uk/index.php?option=com_pubs&Itemid=122&task=show_year&pubid=1714&versionid=23&yearid=161
127 Davies, 2007, appendix
diversity was an issue. However, all stated that they were actively working to diversify their student intake, either in concert with university admission teams, or for specific courses through specialist publications and tutor networks.

The dominant perception was that socio-economic factors and parental expectations are the main barriers to access. The following quote is typical:

*Social class plays a significant issue when analysing the cultural or heritage sector as it is regarded as a white middle-class occupation. Those who work in museums receive poor pay so those who generally work in this area do it on a voluntary basis, as the socially disadvantaged cannot afford to work in such places.*

BAME students are also perceived to be more responsive to parental pressures, with parents tending to steer students into careers in other professions rather than the arts. For example, one interviewee noted:

*The issue is the pressures that BAME students face not to go into the arts sector. The arts and cultural courses are viewed as not being of high status and with low pay, so the BAME students tend to study law, medicine, business and other more academic courses...parents are actively involved in subject choice at a younger age, especially at 16-17 years of age. This results in many mature students who are BAME studying arts courses at a later stage when they are going through a career change.*

Socio-economics and parental pressure, however, are not the sole barriers to increased take-up. Some of the postgraduate course administrators noted that while there is a recognition that more needs to be done to diversify intake, there are significant system wide financial pressures to market courses to attract international students, rather than to focus on access of local BAME populations.

**Higher education institute initiatives to diversify the curriculum**

The majority of the higher education institutes (HEIs) that responded, including all those offering postgraduate courses, include modules or course components related to diversity. For example, De Montfort University offers two second year courses on Arts and Audience Development and Cultural Diversity, which cover multiculturalism and the cultural needs of minority ethnic communities. A quarter of Goldsmith University’s MA in Arts Administration and Cultural Policy is devoted to issues relating to diversity including ‘diversity and impact evaluations’ and ‘diversity policies’.

The Cultural Leadership Programme at City University is a part-time postgraduate programme designed to give knowledge, skills and confidence to emerging leaders in organisations throughout the UK cultural sector. The course anticipates that most participants will be currently employed by organisations but some may be freelancers, consultants, or on career breaks, so the part-time option for the course would be more suited to those in the industry. The programme engages with questions of diversity and the under-representation of women.

**Partnerships and programmes**

The number of programmes and partnerships that have been developed is evidence that diversity is being taken seriously among some HEIs. All of the
museum and heritage related courses were either
taking in Diversify participants or were in talks with
the Museums Association to do so. De Montfort
University works informally with a local South Asian
arts organisation to help with recruitment and is
keen to develop a formal partnership as this has
proved to be an effective approach to date.
Goldsmiths University has been working with
Yellow Earth, a Chinese arts organisation, as well as
a number of other Black and Asian organisations.
BAME representation in higher education has been
assisted by a number of bursary and traineeship
programmes that include tuition fees for
undergraduate and postgraduate courses. For
example, BAME students studying for MAs in
Publishing are now eligible for four bursaries from
the Publishing Training Centre (PTC). Each bursary is
worth £5,000, and will be awarded to students
studying the Publishing courses at four UK
universities: City, London; Oxford Brookes; Napier;
and University College London (UCL). UCL and
The National Archives (TNA) launched a diversity
internship in 2005, which provides one-year work
experience at TNA, and a place on the MA in
Archives and Records Management at UCL for a
candidate from a minority ethnic group. Positive
action traineeships through decibel, Inspire and
Diversify have also included payment or
contributions towards course fees and this model is
being adopted in other areas such as libraries
through CILIP’s proposed Encompass programme.

Informal education and training

It should be noted that in addition to formal
education and training there are informal
opportunities for leadership development. By their
nature these are often difficult to map accurately
and the landscape can change rapidly. However, a
range of education projects run by community-
based organisations or regularly funded arts
organisations aim to enhance access to the arts and
to enable individuals to acquire relevant skills and
training to work and progress in the sector.
Many such projects are music based and while quite
small in scale can still be highly effective in their
local areas. An example is Raw Material, which is a
regularly funded organisation based in Brixton that
has worked successfully with disadvantaged youth
in the area for eight years. It runs Creative
Internships, a twelve-month programme, funded by
City Parochial Fund, through which young
producers, musicians, artists and filmmakers benefit
from a range of creative and technical music and
media activities. It allows participants to gain new
skills, develop professional approaches to
production, undertake creative work in composition
and recording, and to develop their business skills
and understanding of the sector. Professional work
experience, professional briefs and commissioned
work opportunities are also provided, backed up by
a robust industry mentoring, practical seminars,
workshops and work experience programme.
Director Tim Brown notes that:

The programme has enabled people to gain
professional experiences, to test that
experience in a professional context, gain
employment, produce a body of work and
portfolio, have their projects presented to wide
range of audiences and in a range of contexts,
all of which has made a difference to the
participants confidence and sense of self
esteem and ability, which in turn has enabled
them to progress and become role models for
others in their community.
The failure to recruit and attract a more diverse workforce has been highlighted by the Department for Culture Media and Sport as a potential problem for the future growth and prosperity of the sector. In this context, the under-representation of Black, Asian and minority ethnic leaders (BAME) in the cultural sector is a pressing issue that is evidenced by all the available data.

The high BAME take-up of the Cultural Leadership Programme and Clore Leadership Programme development opportunities, and of bursary schemes such as the Inspire and Diversify programmes, challenge the assumptions of some that the lack of representation of people from BAME backgrounds within the sector is due to a lack of interest by ethnic minorities in museum, heritage and other careers in the sector.

The key indicators that we have been able to generate from available data on leadership diversity indicate that against 11.9% of England's working age population being of Black Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) background progress is lagging behind in the following areas:

- 2.3% of accredited library professionals are BAME
- 3.7% of Senior Civil Servants at the Department for Culture Media and Sport are BAME
- 3% of directors of publishing companies are BAME
- 3.3% of strategic & operations managers in national and hub Museums are BAME
- 3.3% of sole directors in the creative and cultural sector are BAME
- 4% of editorial department staff in publishing companies are BAME
- 4.4% of middle managers in National and Hub Museums are BAME
- 4.6% of the entire archive workforce regardless of seniority are BAME
- 5.5% running their business in the creative and cultural sector are BAME
More positively, and reflecting both a drive by the Department for Culture Media and Sport (DCMS) to broaden the diversity of boards, and specific efforts by Arts Council England to diversify its own workforce profile and that of its regularly funded organisations (RFOs):

- 6.3% of over 850 RFOs are BAME-led
- 10.8% of DCMS board appointments to 600 organisations are BAME
- 12.8% of senior managers at Arts Council England are BAME
- 10.5% of the MLA staff are BAME
- 10.2% of managers in RFOs are BAME
- 15% of board members in RFOs are BAME

There are still large gaps in data availability, particularly in relation to the private sector. This makes a holistic and detailed understanding of the scale and extent of BAME under-representation across and within the sector difficult. In addition, establishing a clear baseline of BAME leadership is complicated by the lack of clear boundaries and definitions of what constitutes leadership in the sector. In order to ensure that the number and progress of black, Asian and minority ethnic creative and cultural business leaders and owners is tracked to a useful degree, there need to be significant changes in the collection and reporting of creative industry data.

There is a steady improvement in the collection and availability of workforce data by Non Department Public Bodies and other public sector organisations which now makes it possible to base strategies on a stronger evidence base. However, private sector data remains patchy and variable. Existing industry monitoring mechanisms, including the DCMS Evidence Tool Kit, do not incorporate ethnicity monitoring and there are no current structures for collation of ethnicity related data across the sector. DCMS’s strategic documents for the development of the sector, Staying Ahead and Creative Britain, highlight diversity as a key issue and commitment but the lack of guidance on implementing diversity strategies or on monitoring the equality impact of current strategies remains an issue.

Some parts of the sector have been quicker to address the challenge. Arts Council England has been undertaking developmental work over a number of years that has produced quantifiable results. The museums, libraries and archives sector has in the last few years prioritised the issue, recently undertaking a comprehensive diversity mapping exercise of national and hub museums to establish its workforce profile. Its pioneering work with the Museums Association to deliver the Diversify programme has demonstrated good results. Libraries and archives sector are also now taking a lead from the work being done in the museums sector and beginning to focus on diversity monitoring and development initiatives.

The progress made by Arts Council England on the basis of clear targets and strategies for employment and funding allocation through its Race Equality Scheme indicate the effectiveness of persistence and consistency in establishing strategic direction and investment in ensuring desirable outcomes and progress. Establishing targets provides organisations with a goal to work towards, as well as a focus for planning and
action. However, targets need to be carefully calibrated and related to the specifics of the BAME labour market and dynamics for the sector, sub-sector and job roles. The use of crude national BAME population figures means that initiatives might be seen as successful in meeting recruitment targets that appear high, but which in reality are actually set far too low, or conversely, organisations can be unsuccessful in reaching what is in reality an overambitious target.

**There is a high degree of fragmentation and piecemeal work in the pursuit of workforce diversity across the sector.** While individual programmes and initiatives are to be welcomed and some have been well conceived and produced quantifiable results, many programmes, initiatives and actions inevitably draw on an institutional and organisational view of recruitment and workforce profile needs, rather than on an industry wide view of leadership or the development needs of BAME potential recruits and staff across the sector.

**BAME staff are still not coming through the system and being promoted into leadership positions.** This is likely to present a significant problem in the medium term where the sector has been successful in attracting new entrants at both junior and senior levels.

**Where organisations have recruited directly into leadership positions there is evidence that they may be less successful than their white counterparts.** Often organisations seek out a more diverse pool of candidates and may be successful in recruitment. However, they fail to recognise that, having sought out the ‘different’, the organisation needs to change and support the person more effectively if they are to be successful in the organisation.

**The quality of experiences of BAME leaders is critical in determining whether or not they choose to remain within mainstream arts and cultural institutions.** Low employment mobility, the perceptions of the persistence of old boys networks and of a low ethnicity ceiling can lead many potential BAME leaders to feel suffocated through a lack of opportunity, and to lose morale, motivation and aspirations. Addressing these issues requires organisations to simultaneously focus on institutional cultures and wider change.

**Successful development of workforce diversity depends on there being no artificial social structures and organisational barriers to the achievement of BAME people.** This does not imply that there should be an even distribution of BAME people across the cultural industries. Rather, it is for the industry and its sub-sectors to demonstrate that there are no such barriers and discrimination based on ethnicity, i.e. people of BAME background who choose to do so should be as able to access, develop their careers and lead in the sector as their white counterparts. Benchmarking approaches need to incorporate qualitative research concerning the perceptions, changes in perceptions, and career choices of BAME recruits into the sector alongside quantitative measures to assess progress. In addition to recruitment monitoring, organisations should also measure their progress through staff surveys and through regular equality auditing of performance appraisal systems.
recommendations

Take strategic action

• Repeat the BAME leadership study. This will enable the identification of additional data and the inclusion of any further work done in the interim. Parts of the sector have already made a great deal of progress in the collection of ethnic monitoring and baseline data. The focus now should be on keeping up this momentum and investment, as well as on facilitating the sharing of strategies and best practice with those who are lagging behind.

• Strategic action means the development of a sector wide approach in which all partners undertake work that they can only do for themselves on improving the collection and reporting of their institutional data on BAME leadership, as well as developing a jointly owned information sharing strategy to promote sector wide development.

• The sector needs to consider a long-term structure for the collection, collation and sharing of data and best practices on BAME leadership. Initiatives in the private sector such as the IPA census of the advertising industry and the Diversity in Publishing Network survey of the publishing and literature industry can be leveraged and become part of a regular and consistent sector-wide benchmark. The Cultural Leadership Programme could take the lead in this initially, benchmarking progress against this report. This could lead to the development of a co-ordination mechanism involving all the key stakeholders in the sector and a body of work that the sector can take forward into the longer term, potentially under the remit of Creative & Cultural Skills.

Develop the creative and cultural leadership programmes

• More proactive seeking out of talented BAME people will further enhance the effectiveness of creative and cultural leadership programmes. This can be done through the development and use of a database of potential people and available placements that can be readily accessed by programme providers. The Cultural Leadership Programme is in a position to build on existing contacts and to strengthen and expand those both regionally and across the creative and cultural sector.

• A priority should be to ensure that BAME individuals are aware of and able to access publicly funded creative and cultural leadership and development programmes. Course providers should consider the identification and utilisation of ‘regional ambassadors’ who can inform potential BAME leaders about opportunities and remove any potential perception that they are London-centric.

• Providers should seek to enhance the diversity aspects of course provision through an additional range of catalytic discussion, exploration and support opportunities, ranging from lunch-time seminars or workshops to opportunities for small group discussions with acknowledged BAME leaders in the sector. These could be supplemented by a package of mentoring and coaching support for individuals after the programmes. The proposed Powerbrokers Advance programmes appear to be a positive response to this need.
• There is also scope for more innovative and effective partnering with creative and cultural organisations. Opportunities for engaging with these organisations, such as placements, are immensely valuable in creating more exposure both for BAME leaders and the organisations themselves and give potential leaders more opportunities for development.

Widen the diversity of the pool of students and future BAME leaders

• Education and training providers do collect relevant ethnicity data. However, they need to widen the diversity of the pool students and future BAME leaders by putting in place active programmes and initiatives to increase awareness, knowledge and interest among BAME secondary school children and Further Education students in careers in the sector. Providers should work collaboratively to support the development of creative and cultural industries infrastructure for school-age children that includes informed career guidance and signposting of routes by individuals who have credibility and legitimacy with these students.

• A key priority is to begin to identify career destinations for BAME students in order to ascertain where the problems and blockages may be in translating education and qualifications into employment in the sector.

Public agencies and the sector must continue to take the lead

• Organisations should consider wider culture change approaches alongside ethnic monitoring and recruitment strategies. An important area for development is the provision of training for managers in intercultural competencies and in the recognition of transferable skills so that BAME staffs’ skills and competencies are recognised and they are nurtured and encouraged to progress in their organisations and the sector.

• Broader board-level BAME representation is improving. However, it should be widened to address the syndrome of the same circle of well-known BAME trustees being asked on to the boards of a wide range of organisations. While there are small-scale initiatives such as GAIN working on this issue, at a national level DCMS and Arts Council England should establish a national BAME board bank and develop a new generation of potential BAME trustees.

• The creative and cultural sector should promote its work much more widely in BAME communities and disseminate more basic information as well as creating mechanisms for the development of new networking opportunities. Consultancy and advisory support is also often critical for new BAME enterprises and organisations, while for those that are already established, similar support is often required to develop growth strategies.
• The sector should learn more widely from the other parts of the public sector, particularly in relation to sustainable strategies for the development of BAME leaders. It should also look to parts of the private sector that have used diversity effectively in the search for innovation and growth in markets and market share.

DCMS has a continuing role to play

• DCMS’s Non Departmental Public Bodies (NDPBs) are at the front line of delivery. However, the DCMS itself can provide a valuable leadership role in co-coordinating the activity of all stakeholders and in sharing good practice in data collection to address BAME under-representation across the sector. A key priority is to enhance private sector ethnic monitoring and data collection through its activities under the Creative Economy or similar programmes.

• DCMS should consider developing an action plan and structure to deliver the commitment to diversity set out in its Creative Britain strategy. This could include putting in place appropriate monitoring and evaluation arrangements to ensure that progress on diversity is measured throughout the implementation of the strategy. Its support for implementation could include the development of guidance for the sector on appropriate data collection in relation to BAME representation, including on the workforce, business ownership and numbers in governance structures.

• DCMS could set up a series of workshops to engage NDPBs and private sector organisations and share best practice in management, marketing and leadership practice across the creative and cultural sector. This would build on the Workforce Diversity Working Group that already exists to share good practice and includes DCMS, MLA, Arts Council England, Creative & Cultural Skills, national museums, hub museums and the Museums Association and the GLA.
Benchmarking

Benchmarking emerged from the private sector and migrated to the public sector as a strategic management tool to systematically and continuously improve methods, standards and the quality of goods and services. Benchmarking is often the first and most critical stage for any enterprise in establishing a robust and accurate evidence base to enable monitoring and the measurement of progress. It has been used widely in the field of diversity to measure the quantitative effects of diversity policies on staff and consumer/service user profiles. In relation to ethnicity, this process has been greatly facilitated by the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, which places a statutory general duty on public authorities to promote race equality. Public authorities are expected to have due regard to the need to eliminate racial discrimination, promote equal opportunities and promote good relations between people from different racial groups.

A wide range of public sector institutions have adopted benchmarking to improve workforce diversity and aid workforce development. The Cabinet Office uses baselines and targets, including Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME)
targets for the Senior Civil Service to assess progress on workforce diversity.\footnote{Cabinet Office (2003), \textit{Good Practice Guide – Diversity in Recruitment to the SCS}. www.civilservice.gov.uk/documents/pdf/diversity/diversity_recruitment.pdf} The National Health Service (NHS) review of its workforce diversity provided not only a vital baseline but also a stark indicator of the disparity in workforce diversity between the organisation leadership and the workforce. It found that 35\% of doctors and dentists, 16.4\% of nurses and 11.2\% of non-medical staff are from BAME communities, compared to less than 1\% of the chief executives of the 600 NHS trusts, health boards, local health boards and health and social services boards.\footnote{NHS (2007), \textit{Leadership Interventions for Black and Minority Ethnic Staff in the NHS}}

In the Further Education sector the Network of Black Managers (NBM), commissioned by the Centre for Excellence in Leadership, has undertaken a wide review of BAME leadership in the further education sector, including establishing a robust baseline and creating an accurate BAME manager profile from primary questionnaire data.\footnote{Robin Landman, (2005), \textit{Survey of the Numbers of Black and Minority Ethnic Governors in the Further Education Colleges Sector of England}, Centre for Excellence in Leadership} The Network also tracked data on the career progression of BAME managers who had formerly participated in two major positive action programmes.\footnote{Landman, 2005}

Many private sector companies with strong equality and diversity policies have also started with baseline assessments to demonstrate their commitment on diversity to consumers, staff and shareholders. Initiatives such as the Race for Opportunity have allowed both public sector organisations and private sector companies to compare their progress against other institutions through five ‘impact areas’, including leadership.\footnote{Race for Opportunity (2006), \textit{Benchmarking Report 2006 – Measuring Impact}}

\section*{Research method}

The benchmarking for this study involved mapping, collating and analysing existing data held throughout the sector alongside primary qualitative and quantitative data collection and analysis. This encompasses emerging, mid-career and established leaders, as well as a consideration of the potential pool and educational opportunities available to facilitate the development and emergence of future leaders in the sector. The study employed both quantitative and qualitative measures to benchmark leadership in the industries:

\subsection*{Literature review}

An extensive literature review covered key documents from DCMS, NESTA, Arts Council England, Creative & Cultural Skills, Learning Skills Council, Lifelong Learning UK, MLA and other key cultural and creative organisations and institutions. It helped to identify key data sets that could be used to benchmark the current knowledge on leadership in the sector.

\subsection*{Statistical benchmarking}

Considerable improvements need to be made to the way in which data is collected. This situation is acute for ethnicity data in the sector although there are examples of good practice and improving data collection is high on the agenda of many key organisations and agencies.

Key datasets included Arts Council England’s database of regularly funded organisations, MLA’s hub and national museum workforce database, the Annual Population Survey and smaller databases such as CILIP’s membership database for library professionals.
Qualitative consultation

• Stakeholder consultation involved 25 key partners, individuals, and government and public sector organisations concerning BAME leadership and development issues.

• Consultation with BAME leaders included qualitative research which enabled us to understand what the current experiences of BAME leaders are in the sector and how leadership is defined and exercised. Primary qualitative data was collected through semi-structured interviews with 25 BAME professionals. These explored issues linked to aspirations, profiles of established and emerging BAME leaders across the sectors and the take-up, experiences and outcomes for established and aspiring leaders from BAME backgrounds in relation to leadership opportunities and current development programmes. These interviews were conducted as an open inquiry in the interests of generating as much rich contextual data as possible.

• Five focus groups were run with BAME professionals in London, Birmingham, Manchester and Leeds. Each group consisted of 10-12 participants and we sought a balance between artists, creative/cultural businesses and leaders of arts organisations. A total of 42 people took part in the focus groups. Participants were recruited through the Cultural Leadership Programme, partner organisations and a desktop review of BAME-led organisations in the sector.

Education and private sector survey

Because of the limitations of official data sources in the creative and cultural sector two surveys were used to augment and provide greater detail on both education provision related to the sector and the profile of creative businesses.

The education survey was sent to the administrators of creative and cultural sector specific courses at 90 higher education institutions. A total of 21 responses were received, a response rate of 23%. Eleven were willing to supply monitoring statistics on the ethnicity of their course members. This included all seven postgraduate course administrators.

The creative business survey contacted creative businesses in England with more than 15 employees from the National Business Database supplied by Experian. The survey asked about:

• Main focus/activity of business
• Local/regional/national focus
• Size of business: employees
• Size of business: approximate turnover
• Ethnicity of ownership: directors
• BAME board representation

One-to-one interviews were conducted with HR representatives to better understand:

• Leadership support, development opportunities and provision
• Strategies to increase employment diversity
• Key barriers to ethnic minority representation
Focus group participant profile

Gender split

- Male: 58%
- Female: 42%

Regional split

- Manchester: 32%
- Leeds: 11%
- Birmingham: 30%
- London: 11%

Ethnicity split

- Black African: 7%
- Black Caribbean: 41%
- Pakistani: 20%
- Indian: 16%
- Chinese: 5%
- White: 2%
- Mixed heritage: 9%
Arts Council England and The Bookseller (2004), *In Full Colour: Cultural Diversity in Book Publishing Today*

Arts Council England (2002), *Eclipse Report*

Arts Council England (2004), *Turning point: a strategy for the contemporary visual arts in England*


Cabinet Office (2003), *Ethnic Minorities and the Labour Market*

Cabinet Office (2003), *Good Practice Guide: Diversity in Recruitment to the SCS*

CCS (2006), *One year on: delivering skills to the sector*

Centre for Educational Development, Appraisal and Research/Warwick Institute for Employment Research (2005), *Working in the presentation of the contemporary visual arts: key challenges for the sector*

Civil Service (2008), *Promoting Equality and Valuing Diversity: A Strategy for the Civil Service*

Clore Duffield Foundation Task Force report (2002), *An Investment in the Rising Generation of Cultural Leaders is Necessary, and Timely*

Creative & Cultural Skills (2007), *Footprint: A baseline for the creative and cultural sector*

Creative & Cultural Skills (2008), *Creative Blueprint – England*


Davies, M. (2007), *Tomorrow’s People: Entry into the Museums Sector*

DCMS (2002), *Race Equality Scheme*

DCMS (2006), *DCMS Equality Scheme 2007-2010*

DCMS (2007), *Staying ahead: the economic performance of the UK’s creative industries*

DCMS (2008), *Creative Britain: New Talents for the New Economy*

Devlin, G., Hilary Carty and Nicola Turner (2008), *Meeting the Challenge*


Drucker, P. (1996), *Leader of the Future*

EHRC (2008), *Ethnic Monitoring*

European Commission (2005), *The Business Case for Diversity: Good Practices in the Workplace*


GLA (2003), *Play it Right: Asian Creative Industries in London*

GLA Economics (2005), *London’s Creative Sector: Update*

Hewison R. (2006), *Leadership and cultural values*, *Demos*


IPA (2008), *Agency Census 2007: a report on employment in IPA member agencies*

IPA, (2005), *Ethnic Representation in Agencies*

Landman, R. (2005), Survey of the Numbers of Black and Minority Ethnic Governors in the Further Education Colleges Sector of England, Centre for Excellence in Leadership

LLUK and MLA (2007), *Profile of the Archives Workforce in England*

MCAAH (2003) *Delivering Shared Heritage*

McMaster, B. (2008), *Supporting Excellence in the Arts: From Measure to Judgment*


NHS (2007), *Leadership Interventions for Black and Minority Ethnic Staff in the NHS*

Niessen, J. and Huddleston, T. (2007), *Setting up a System of Benchmarking to Measure the Success of Integration Policies in Europe*

Race For Opportunity (2003), *Monitoring Ethnicity*


*The Leadership Challenge: A review of management and leadership in subsidised arts organisations in England, Metier, 2000*
